A
J
PAM

African Journal of Public Administration and Management

Vol V-VII, No. 2 • July 1996

African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM)

African Journal of Public Administration and Management

Vol V-VII, No. 2 • July 1996

African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

AAPAM is very grateful to the Management for Change Programme of CIDA and The Institute of Public Administration of Canada (IPAC) for the financial support given to publish this journal.

EDITOR: M. Jide Balogun

Members (Editorial Board)

- M. Jide Balogun (Chairman)
- Gelase Mutahaba
- Peter Ayang Nyong'o
- Eshetu Chole
- Yoramu R. Barongo
- Pontso Sekatle
- T.B. Wereko
- A.D. Yahaya

Book Review Editors

- M. Njau (Mrs)
- Kofi Ankomah

EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Hon. PKH Kedikilwe
Minister of Commerce
Industry
Gaborone, Botswana

Mr. W.N. Wamalwa
President of AAPAM
Nairobi, Kenya.

Dr. Ibbo Mandaza
Executive Director
SAPES TRUST
Harare, Zimbabwe

Dr. Sadig Rasheed
Director of Programmes
UNICEF
New York, NY 10017
USA.

Hon. Prof. Dr. Apollo R. Nsibambi
Minister of Public Service
Kampala
Uganda

The Director-General
ESAMI, Arusha,
Tanzania.

Dr. Mohan Kaul
Director, Fellowships
Training and MDP
Commonwealth
Secretariat London, U.K.

Hon. Simone de Comarmond
Minister of Education
Ministry of Education
Mahe, Seychelles

Prof. Goran Hyden
Dept. of Political Science
University of Florida
Gainesville Fl32611
Florida, USA.

Prof. Joseph Owona
Minister,
Ministry of Administrative
Reform
Yaounde, Cameroon.

Ms. Angela King
Director, Office of Human
Resources Management,
UN Headquarters,
New, York, NY 10017,
USA

GUIDE TO CONTRIBUTIONS

AJPAM is a bi-annual publication of the African Association for Public Administration and Management. It appears in January and July each year. Manuscripts focusing on problems of public/development administration in Africa are invited from all parts of the world. Contributions which are based on experiences outside Africa but providing useful comparative lessons are also welcome.

Preference will be given to empirically based works or to articles suggesting new insights and innovative ideas in African Administration.

Contributors are advised to submit their manuscripts in duplicate. The typing must be double-spaced, and the length should not exceed 4,000 words. Footnotes should be limited to observations/comments which do not from part of the bibliographic reference. In citing sources, contributors should simply refer in the text to the author(s)' name(s), year of publication, and the page(s) from which the material is cited.

An alphabetical listing of the sources should follow at the end of the article.

The views expressed in each article are those of author(s). Neither AJPAM nor AAPAM should be held liable for any residual errors.

Contributions should be forwarded to:

M. Jide Balogun
Editor, AJPAM
P.O. Box 3005
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

The African Association for Public Administration and Management

AFRICAN JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT

Special Issue on the Seventeenth Roundtable Conference of AAPAM

CONTENTS

List of Contributors ***iv***

Editorial Introduction ***v***

Civil Service Reform Priorities ad Strategies: An overview of Afrcan Experience, *James Nti* ***vi***

Customer Service as an Element of the Ugandan Civil Service Reform Programme, *Geneviere E. Kyarimpa* ***1***

The Core Elements of Civil Service Reform, *Robert Dodoo* ***12***

Civil Service Reform Priorities in a New Nation: Focus on Namibia, *M. F. Cupido* ***36***

Core Elements of Civil Service Reform: Focus on Tanzania, *Deogratias A. Ntukamazina* ***47***

List of Contributors

1. *Mr. James Nti* is Deputy President of AAPAM. He heads a management consulting firm in Accra, Ghana.

2. *Ms Geneviere E. Kyarimpa* is a Lecturer at Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda.

3. *Dr. Robert Dodoo* is Head of the Ghana Civil Service.

4. *Ms. M.F. Cupido* is a member of the Namibian Public Service Commission. She also served as a member of the Wage and Salary Commission established by the Namibia Government in January 1995.

5. *Deogratias A. Ntukamazina* is Chairman of the Civil Service Reform Committee, Office of the President, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

EDITORIAL INTRODUCTION

In this special issue, AJPAM focuses on the Seventeenth Roundtable Conference of AAPAM which took place in Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt, between 2nd and 5th March 1996. For obvious reasons, it has not been possible to include in this collection every paper presented in Cairo. In any case, the conference proceedings have been summarized and reproduced in this issue.

The five papers carried in this Special Issue cover the broad range of topics discussed at the conference. James Nti's article, for instance, raises conceptual issues, in addition to those of scope and strategy of administrative reform.

Genevieve Kyarimpa's paper advances the proposition that administrative (or civil service) reform is meaningless unless and until it leads to increased 'customer' satisfaction and significant improvements in customer relations. Proceeding from this underlying premise, she examines the Uganda government's efforts at fostering a positive customer orientation in the delivery of public services, and at promoting high ethical and performance standards.

Robert Dodoo's and Ntukamazina's contributions both highlight the merits of an inward-propelled strategy of civil service reform. Between the two contributions, it is possible to deduce that a local civil service reform initiative which targets specific problems - problems "crying out for solutions" - is likely to yield greater dividends than an externally drafted reform agenda.

Mabella Cupido's paper shows that the core elements of civil service reform in the relatively new nation of Namibia are not radically different from those in the older states. Namibia, like many other countries in sub-Saharan Africa, has to grapple with essentially the same issues of reform which keep appearing on contemporary reform agenda -civil service size and cost, privatization/divestiture, methods and procedure rationalization, productivity and performance management, ethics and accountability, and 'customer' relations. What makes the Namibian situation somehow unique is the need to balance the claims of the formerly disadvantaged groups (the majority black population) with those of their white compatriots. As noted by Cupido, the government has managed the situation by implementing a policy of affirmative action without reneging on its pledge of reconciliation.

There is no doubt that the papers presented at the Cairo Roundtable offer vital lessons for civil service reform and public service management. First, and everything being equal, policy makers should profit from the constant reminder at the conference that the success of the on-going economic restructuring and liberalization measures hinges on the replacement of costly and time-consuming systems and procedures with service-oriented one-stop arrangements. Secondly, it is necessary to underscore the continuous and un-ending nature of reform - specifically, the view that long after the completion of the "formal" reform processes, managers and administrators still have a major role to play in reviewing, redesigning, and monitoring the performance of, systems and procedures. Above all, Cairo brought to the fore a major factor in civil service reform - one which, has unfortunately been too often overlooked. This is the human factor. If any topic received the delegates' undivided attention, it is that of human resource development and management. It was agreed that successful implementation of administrative/civil service reform programmes depended to a large extent on the complementary actions taken on the human resource front -particularly, regarding the training, selection, deployment, evaluation, and motivation of the various classes of civil servants.

The editors welcome reactions to this special issue and to issues of public service management in general.

CIVIL SERVICE REFORM PRIORITIES AND STRATEGIES: AN OVERVIEW OF AFRICAN EXPERIENCE

James Nti

Introduction

Every government in Africa acknowledges that the achievement of its social and economic development objectives depends on an effective civil service. In line with this realization, African countries, since the 1950s, have taken various steps aimed at enhancing the administrative capabilities of their civil services.

In this connection, difference types of civil service reforms have been instituted. Among these are those meant to consolidate the sovereignty of the various countries, particularly immediately after gaining independence, those geared towards redynamising, indeed, retooling, the civil services to enhance their efficiency and effectiveness, and of late, those aimed at solving the economic crises confronting many African countries. These relate essentially to the creation of the most appropriate conditions for private sector growth.

Thus, as may be seen, the reforms instituted by African countries have gradually covered every sphere of public management thereby causing the boundaries of civil service reform to shift from time to time. Change, of course, must be expected. However, in this case, the shifts in the boundaries have created problems of definition, particularly, as regards the scope and essence of civil service reform.

I. The meaning of Civil Service/Administrative Reform

Due to the frequent use of the term administrative or civil service reform, the tendency is to assume that there is a commonly shared view or understanding of the term. However, the pertinent literature portrays a different picture. It indicates that there is no generally accepted definition of the term. This is borne out by the numerous definitions. While some scholars use the term synonymously with administrative change and administrative improvement, others introduce a variety of distinctions in usage. Among the definitions of administrative reform frequently encountered in the interature are:

- the artificial inducement of administrative transformation against resistance;
- a consciously induced and directed change in the machinery of government;
- The processes designed to rejuvenate the administrative systems of new states and enhance the systems' capacity to manage development;
- the reorganisation of public service management;
- an effort to apply new ideas to the administrative system with a view to improving the system for positive goals of development;
- a deliberate step to use power, authority and influence to change the goals, structure or procedures of a bureaucracy;
- a change directed at the main features of an administrative system;
- specially designed efforts to induce fundamental change in public administration systems through system-wide reforms, or, at least, through measures for the improvement of one or more of the key elements such as administrative structures, personnel and processes.

Difficulties are encountered when the various definitions are examined. For a start, we have to deal with two conflicting perspectives - one seeking to disconnect the process of administrative change from that of administrative reform, and the other insisting that administrative reforms, by definition, involves change. Restricting the definition of administrative reform to the reorganization of the machinery of government creates problems because civil service reform could involve more that just the structural aspect of the machinery of government. Indeed some types of reform may not even involve reorganization.

So far, we seem to have conveyed the impression that administrative reform is something that is restricted to new states only, but it is well known that administrative reform has global relevance and is being pursued by both the developing and the developed countries. Some of the definitions seem to restrict the objectives of administrative reform to ensuring the administrative systems' capacity to implement economic development only, and yet the civil service, as an organization, is involved also in the delivery of social/welfare services, and needs to develop a capacity for effectively discharging that responsibility as well.

The viability and validity of the various distinctions would appear to be questionable since administrative reform may include not only reorganization

by also the creation of new institutions, the establishment of decentralized, participative, and consultative bodies, the introduction of new procedures and techniques, or the rationalization and streamlining of existing procedures and techniques.

It may be argued that "reform" involves the concepts of change and improvement. Reform connotes the idea of a change for the better. There is need to simplify matters for the hard-pressed top civil servant who has to take several decisions in a day, so that he/she does not have to stop in his/her tracks to agonize, every now and again, over whether what he/she plans to do is administrative reform, administrative change or administrative improvement. To those who live day in day out with problems of inefficiency and ineffectiveness, what is of interest and benefit is not refined definitions of terms but pragmatic issues like the design of problem-solving reform programmes, the strategies for effective implementation, and mechanisms for the evaluation of the impact and results of reforms.

There are encouraging signs that a consensus is being reached. One such sign is the fact that all definitions of the term "administrative reform" accept that the aim sought by that activity is the improvement of the administrative system and the enhancement of the system's capacity. To advance the march towards a consensus, the following working definition will suffice for the time being, viz:

> *"A systematic process of introducing changes with the objective of improving management practices, eliminating or at least minimizing the dysfunctions in the structures and processes of an existing administrative system to make it more efficient and effective in attaining its objectives and sustaining such gains".*

II. Nature of Civil Service Reform

Certain elements of civil service reform have become discernible from the foregoing discussion. The first is that civil service reform is normally geared towards improving the civil service system, be it the totality of the system, or only some of its component parts, with the objective of enhancing its capacity for carrying out its assigned functions efficiently and effectively.

Another is that the boundaries of civil service reform keep expanding as a result of circumstances warranting changes in priorities and in public service management focus. This dynamism may also result from the need to rectify the adverse side-effects or impact of earlier civil service reform initiatives. These shifts of boundaries, from time to time gives civil service reform a dynamic nature. They also portray civil service reforms as being unending i.e. they create the impression that civil service reform goes on all the time.

These two points, namely the dynamic and the unending nature of civil service reforms, as well as the variety of those reforms are clearly illustrated by Africa's experience. Administrative reform activities undertaken in Africa since the 1950s can be classified under three broad headings which, for ease of reference, may be designated as first, second and third generation reforms.

First-generation reforms

The first generation reforms related to the needs and demands of sovereignty. Those reforms concerned the establishment of national civil services and the major thrust was the indigenization or localization of the services. It also required the creation of an administrative apparatus which was not only big enough to cope with the envisaged expanding role of government, but would also ensure a smooth transfer of decision-making power from the colonial civil servants to politicians. Consequently, ministries and other agencies were created. To cater also for the need for enhanced responsiveness to the requirements of the vast majority of the population (which is based in the rural areas), and to encourage popular participation, reform initiatives directed toward decentralization and the establishment of local government institutions were undertaken. In effect, therefore, the first generation reforms were politically motivated.

Second-generation Reforms

The second generation reforms resulted from the work of high-powered Civil Service Review Commissions appointed by governments in the late 60s and early 70s, such as the Mills-Odoi Commission in Ghana, the Udoji Commission in Nigeria, the Ndegwa Commission in Kenya and the Wamalwa Commission in Swaziland. A number of factors triggered these reform drives. Among these was the realization that the civil services inherited from the colonial authorities needed to be redynamised to respond to the expectations

and the mood of urgency prevailing within the new governments. In countries like Nigeria and Ghana (1965/66) there had been sudden changes of government and the new governments were in the mood to correct past ills. In other counties, pressing socio-economic factors and ideological commitment to socio-economic modernization demanded the reform of the administrative systems. Such reform efforts were encouraged by the Fulton Commission Report which had an international 'demonstration effect'.

These Review Commissions stressed the need for the reform of the policy-making and strategic institutions. It is interesting to note that APPER and UN-PAAERD in proposing measures to stem the socio-economic crisis in Africa and put the continent on a path of self-sustained growth in the 1980s, had placed the same emphasis on structural transformation and institutional reform as the review Commissions had done earlier in the 60s and 70s.

Third-generation Reforms

The third generation reforms were those emerging in the 80s from the conditionalities imposed by the Bretton-Woods institutions in connection with the loans (SALs) for Structural Adjustment Programmes. These reforms have involved the radical downsizing (or is it rightsizing?) of the civil services of participating countries, the severe reduction in the size of government, and, in some cases, elimination of controls (such as exchange control, import licensing, price controls) the elimination, or, at least reduction of budget deficits, and the creation of conditions favourable to private sector development.

Hitherto administrative reform had concentrated on the bureaucracy. With the promulgation of the third-generation reforms, the government and the private sector were drawn into the reform process. The governments, in particular, have been asked to disengage from direct economic and productive activities, and to privatize state-owned enterprises. The private sector in contrast is being required to take on a bigger role. This has complicated matters for civil servants who hitherto operated under one-party regimes or military dictatorships.

III. Administrative Reform: Approaches and Strategies

It should be noted that the nature of each category of reforms described is different. In fact even where the objective was the same e.g. indigenization,

the approach and strategy adopted to reach that end varied from one country to the other. Thus there are many varieties of administrative reform.

In this connection, it is pertinent to draw attention to a typology developed by Jide Balogun in 1975, delineating four types of administrative reform activities. These are:

(a) Structural-consolidative (minimum interference with, or change in, administrative institutions);
(b) Structural-innovative (emphasizing extensive reform of public personnel and budgetary systems, accounting procedures, planning processes, organization and management - in other words, a Big Push approach);
(c) Integral-consolidative (an "unbalanced" social development strategy entailing minimum change in public service structure and processes but maximum socio-economic and political "modernization", and;
(d) Integral-innovative (maximum change across the board, to ensure rapid and simultaneous "modernization" on all fronts).

This conceptual framework, as has been pointed out elsewhere, provides a glimpse into the types of administrative reform activities undertaken in the immediate post-independence period and provides hints of what was to come later.

Scope of civil service reform

The first- and second-generation civil service reforms may be regarded as belonging to history. In discussing the scope of civil service reforms, therefore, the focus will be on the third generation reforms which are still going on.

The coverage of these reform activities is almost all-embracing. Included in these activities are the conditionalities for good governance and democratization, shrinking the role of government, divestiture and privatization of public enterprises and the creation of appropriate conditions to stimulate private sector growth.

On the purely civil service side, the major reform activities include downsizing the civil service through recruitment freezes, forced early retirement

and decentralization; restructuring; rationalization of pay structures; strengthening and professionalization of public sector management; corporate planning; budgeting (including budget deficit reduction) and, in some countries, achieving representativeness 'through affirmative action' programmes. Thus encapsulated under these reforms as far as the civil service per se is concerned, are the major components of public management,namely, planning, human resources management, financial management, reorganization, institution strengthening and capacity building.

The approaches and strategies for undertaking these reform activities differ in some essential details from one country to another. Various countries, international organizations and scholars hold different views regarding the merits of comprehensive, government-wide, as against those of individualized, incremental, or partial reforms. For instance, Ibrahim Sihata holds the view that there is almost no viable alternative to comprehensive reforms. Milton A. Esman, in contrast, advocates a bottom-up approach to administrative reform. According to him, a modest approach is more effective than the comprehensive, system-wide strategy. The later, he claims, disrupts familiar routines and threatens established centres of power without demonstrating convincingly its innate efficacy. Esman therefore prescribes incremental, confidence-building measures such as training, and the involvement of staff in the introduction of new processes and technologies.

The World Bank argues that the choice between a comprehensive and an incremental approach depends on the particular conditions existing in a country, the level of initial resistance to reform and the reform process itself.

The UNDP advocates an approach that combines both comprehensive and partial reform strategies including even the creation of reform islands or enclaves. The UNDP holds the view that what is needed is an interactive process between comprehensive civil service reform, on the one hand, and the building or strengthening of management capacity in specific ministries and agencies, on the other.

Botswana and Tunisia, two countries in Africa which have recorded significant achievements in civil service reform, apply different strategies. Botswana's approach is incrementalist whereas Tunisia's strategy is global and integrated. These examples clearly indicate that there is no one-best-way to achieve success in civil service reform.

The major feature that is common to successful cases of reform is what has been called the "principle of intentionality" which holds that sustainable reform is more likely to occur if leaders plot in advance where they want to go and what steps they need to take--and in what order--to get there. It involves having a vision, formulating the grand goals in consultation with key stake holders and plotting and sequencing the necessary steps. The chances of such reform programmes succeeding are enhanced if they are formulated locally while drawing on external resources and ideas.

IV. Competencies required for Civil Service Reforms

For the formulation and effective implementation of a civil service reform initiative, certain competencies are required. It is not enough for a government to have a vision or grand goals. Such foresight needs to be concretized through the formulation of the grand goals which correspond with the strategy, systems and programmes to be adopted in reaching the goals. The successful implementation of programmes depends to large extent, on the methods and efficacy of implementation as well as the sequence of steps that are taken. In all these, the civil service would have to be closely involved.

In this regard, the following are some of he competencies needed:

- Policy analysis skills to provide the capacity to clarify the process for making decisions and ensure that decisions rely on objective analysis rather than on personal preferences;
- Strategic Planning Skills to ensure that forecasts of requirements to achieve intended goals are done with some objectivity; that inputs are clearly specified and programmes are properly planned;
- Modern data collection and dissemination skills: information management skills are required to generate the data essential to decision-making;
- Human Resources Management Skills: to ensure that:

  (a) persons with the required skills would be made available at the time required and that such skills would be developed continuously through training;

  (b) proper systems would be established to promote effectiveness in recruiting qualified persons and

(c) effective strategies would be adopted for retaining and rewarding high-performing staff i.e that meritocracy would be promoted and mediocrity, discouraged.

- Financial and Accounting Skills: to ensure:

  (a) that systems would be established for proper budget planning and preparation, control of expenditures and for promoting credible procurement and contracting;
  (b) that sound financial accounting and auditing practices are installed.

- Change management skills: to monitor progress in the implementation of change, remove or minimize resistance to change, and propose measures aimed at responding to the unintended consequences (side-effects) of change.

It is common knowledge that in most African countries, persons with the skills listed above are generally in short supply, and a number of programmes, including the much-touted economic development programmes, suffered as a result of weak executive capacity. It is also well known that the fundamental problem facing most african countries today is the governments' inability to provide, at an acceptable level, services demanded by the public.

It does seem that most African Governments do not fully appreciate the importance of attracting, retaining and motivating high-quality staff. At the level of statutes and rules as well as in public pronouncements, much lip-service is paid to the importance of fostering meritocracy, but these intentions tend to end there for most governments in Africa. And yet, one of the critical factors in the emergence of the Asian economic miracle is the attention paid to merit and excellence in human resource management.

Conclusion

For the achievement of the objectives of economic development and good governance, an efficient and effective civil service is a sine qua non. In recognition of this crucial role, governments in both the developed and developing countries institute from time to time, civil service reforms with the aim of enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of their civil services.

Such reforms are more likely to succeed if the nature and scope of the reforms, and particularly the strategy for implementing those reforms, fully reflect the peculiar conditions and circumstances of the country concerned and the availability of the relevant competencies. The chances of having a reform programme fitting this ideal are greater if the nationals of each country formulate the reform programme and the associated implementation strategy, drawing on external inputs as and when necessary.

REFERENCES

1. G.E. Caiden (1996) *Administrative Reform*, Chicago, Aldine Antherton

2. A.F. Leemans (1976), "Overviews", in A.F. Leemans (ed.) *The Management of Change in Government*, The Hague, Martins Njihoff

3. A. Adedeji, (1972) "Formulating Administrative Reform Strategies in Africa", *Quarterly Journal of Administration*, Vol. VI, No.3, April 1972. See also W.N. Wamalwa and M.J. Balogun, (1992) "Public Service Review Commissions and Administrative Reform in Africa", *AJPAM*, Vol. I No.1, January 1992.

4. M.J. Balogun, "Management Improvement in a Period of Transition: a paradigm and a Suggestion", in C.A. Baker and M.J. Balogun (eds) *Ife Essays in Administration*, University, of Ife Press, Ile-Ife, 1975.

5. I.F. Sihata, "Administrative Reform in Developing Countries: Some General Observations" in S. Chaudry, G.J. Reid, and W.H. Malik (eds), *Civil Service Reform in Latin America and the Caribbean* (Conference Proceedings), The World Bank, Washington D.C.

6. M.J. Esman (1991), *Management Dimensions of Development: Perspectives and Strategies*, West Hartford, Connecticut, Kumarian Press Inc. See also Wamalwa and Balogun's assessment of comprehensive reform strategies, AJPAM, 1992, op.cit.

7. L. Adamolekum (1991) "Public Sector Management Improvement in Sub-Saharan Africa: The World Bank Experience", *Public administration*

and Development, II, pp.223-227. See also B. Nunberg and J. Nellis (1990), "Civil Service Reform and the World Bank", Policy Research Working Paper No. 422, Washington D.C.

8. Clay Wescott, "Civil Service Reform in Africa", in Chaudry et al, op.cit.

CUSTOMER SERVICE AS AN ELEMENT OF THE UGANDAN CIVIL SERVICE REFORM PROGRAMME

Genevieve E. Kyarimpa

Introduction

In the 1980s many nations (developed and developing) became aware that their administrative systems were sluggish, inflexible and insensitive to changing human needs and the novel circumstances of development planning. While the developed world worried over the huge costs of their burgeoning public sector, the developing countries were faced with lack of resources, shortage of skilled manpower and miscellaneous development management problems. This paper reviews the efforts undertaken to tackle some of the problems facing the Ugandan public service.

I. Definition of Terms

The term 'administrator reform' has different meanings to different people in different political systems. According to Leemans,

> *"administrative reform is an effort... to improve the administrative organizations and practices, or to inculcate a different behaviour in order to increase efficiency and effectiveness of government machinery".*

He argues that reforms adopted by the developing countries inclined towards changes of structures, administrative methods and techniques, neglecting the behavioral aspects of organization and administration, with the result that the change tended to be purely formal and to have little effect on the actual operations of the administrative system.

While Leemans defines administrative reform in terms of administrative organization, Caiden views administrative reform in terms of power politics. He defines administrative reform as "the artificial inducement of administrative transformation against resistance". Caiden suggests that reform does not happen by itself, it has to be introduced deliberately and this calls for continued political support. This means there have to be clear objectives towards which

the government initiates reforms and for which individuals and units would be held responsible in the process of implementation.

Reforms are a complex phenomenon and are determined by a country's socio-economic and political situation. Caiden further argues that there is nothing like a universal approach to administrative reform because of the different circumstances prevailing in each country. In agreeing with this view, Riggs states that any attempt to transplant a reform strategy from one country to another would be completely futile and may even be dysfunctional to the recipient country. Caiden echoes the fears when he states that the attempt by individuals and international organizations at espousing universal principles of administrative reform, failed. By the 1980s, most countries had adopted their own approaches, borrowing where they could from their neighbours' experience.

However, Dror identifies a few common characteristics of administrative reform. According to him, (i) administrative reform is a deliberate and conscious effort, (ii) major administrative reforms are political in nature and usually encounter internal resistance, (iii) administrative reform is expected to change the behaviour of administrators and their relationship with the citizenry and (iv) the reform process needs time to yield results.

While it is possible that there are some common characteristics in reforms, we still contend that a country's socio-economic, geo-political situation and historical background determine and influence the course of the reforms.

The Civil Service

The civil service is the operational arm of government charged with the analysis, implementation and administration of public policy. it is the executive arm of public administration. The civil service manages the day-to-day affairs of the state by administering public services and back-stopping government operations. The civil service has the obligation to keep the political leadership informed about the manner in which government policies and programmes are implemented and with what results.

Customer Service

Government customers are those people who consume, or benefit from, the goods and services provided by the government. This means that everybody

in a nation is a government customer because directly or indirectly, government policy impacts on each of them. Services such as roads , water, electricity and law enforcement have implications not only for the economy but also for the generality of the people. Unlike economic and profit-driven goods, however, public goods are paid for indirectly, through taxation and other fiscal measures. All the same, the tax payers expect government to meet their needs and avail them value for their money in terms of prompt delivery of quality services. In a democratic polity, the tax payers express their preferences for the various categories of public goods by casting their votes for leaders who show the greatest promise of meeting the people's "demands" and turning out of office those unable to fulfil the wishes of the majority. Accordingly, a government that is anxious to acquire and retain the support of the people cannot avoid attaching priority to the development of a customer service orientation in the implementation of programmes.

II. Evolution of the Ugandan Civil Service

Like other colonial administrations, the Ugandan civil service was an instrument of the colonial power--specifically, Great Britain. It was mainly concerned with the maintenance of law and order, the collection of taxes and the provision of economic infrastructure. The colonial service did not have to deal with the complex socio-economic and political issues facing the present-day administration.

The colonial service was highly stratified, with the Europeans occupying the top administrative and professional positions, the Asians, most of the intermediate executive and technical positions, while indigenous Africans were confined to clerical, secretarial and other subordinate positions. The service operated within the framework defined by the British government. As observed by the first Prime Minister of Uganda, "the administrative system in this country was designed by the British to serve their own needs and its main task was to maintain law and order. The public administration was then neither responsible nor responsive to the will of the people".

Prior to independence, in the period 1940-50, the colonial administration made efforts to change the terms and conditions of the civil service. For instance, in 1947, it set up the Holmes Commission which was to review the structure, appointments and remuneration of the civil service. The Commission subsequently recommended that all positions within the civil service be opened

to all qualified persons from all races in order to promote equity. After independence, the government embarked on a policy of Africanisation of the civil service. This policy entailed the replacement of expatriates with Africans. It, however, left the colonial structure itself fundamentally intact. The beneficiaries of the Africanisation policy were happy to retain the privileges associated with the old structure but showed little inclination towards improving the service delivery capacity of governmental organizations. Commenting on the experience of Kenya, it was observed that:

> *"The structure predisposed educated Africans confined in subordinate roles prior to independence, to perceive themselves as presumptive elite, as the rightful beneficiaries of the system of inequality".*

The inherited structures, with elements such as class, hierarchy, red-tapism, later became major factors influencing the growth, size and performance of the Ugandan civil service. The Ugandan civil service of the 1990s is still largely patterned after the colonial administration, although recent reform measures would appear to be inclined towards substantive change in the prevailing management culture.

III. The Civil Service Reform Programme in Uganda

Like many developing countries undertaking structural adjustment programmes, Uganda is trying to restructure and revitalize its economy and redefine the role of government in meeting the development needs of the people. The objective is to raise the efficiency and effectiveness of the civil service, revitalize the public sector as a whole, and promote private sector development.

In January 1986, after years of a bitter civil war, the National Resistance Movement (NRM) and its military wing, the National Resistance Army (NRA), headed by Yoweri Museveni, captured power in Uganda. It found the national economy completely destroyed, the public sector in disarray, the civil service bloated, and a work force lacking in motivation, commitment, and discipline. The civil service, in particular, was riddled with institutional defects and corruption. It was unresponsive and inefficient. Its reputation as "the best in Africa south of the Sahara" was shattered. In effect, the civil service as the implementing arm of government, was not fulfilling its mandate.

International donor agencies, notably the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, voiced their concerns over the size, cost and effectiveness of the Ugandan civil service. They argued that it was too large, too expensive, and nonproductive. Prior to 1981, these international agencies were only marginally involved in civil service reform, and that involvement was limited to the occasional interventions in selected areas of public administration, such as public service training, and the strengthening of public service training institutes. By the beginning of the 1980s, however, structural adjustment lending, with its emphasis on fiscal austerity and macro-economic policy review), drew the World Bank closer than ever before into civil service reform. In Uganda, the current civil service reform programme started as an integral part of the structural adjustment programme (SAP) negotiated with the Bretton-Woods institutions. In most cases, the donor agencies provide the funds and technical assistance necessary for implementing the retrenchment component of the reforms (See table 1). The problem with reforms which are not locally conceived is that the sustainability of managerial and institutional changes introduced as part of the reforms tend to be endangered, especially when the donors pull out.

In Uganda, the ability of civil servants to carry out the routine - much less the complex - functions of governments, is severely constrained by lack of motivation resulting from very low salaries. All the same, with the frequent cut-back in government spending, coupled with wide-ranging demands from the citizenry, the issue of service-delivery at affordable cost began to surface. Besides, if the government's development goals (particularly the restructuring and revitalization of the economy embodied it its Ten Point Programme) were to be realized, it was essential that the Civil Service be radically reorganized. The government accordingly appointed the Public Service Review and Reorganization Commission (PSRRC) in April 1989, to diagnose the problems and come up with appropriate recommendations. In particular, the Commission was to address four key issues, namely, personnel management, organizational structure, accountability/financial management and service conditions. The over-riding objective was the establishment of a new, efficient, accountable, and citizen-oriented civil service.

Table 1: Donor Financing for Retrenchment in Ugandan Civil Service

	Funds Provided (US$ Million)	Funds Released (US$ million)	Balance Remaining (US$ million)
UK	3.00	2.96	0.04
Sweden	3.33	3.33	0.00
Denmark	2.73	0.41	2.32
Netherlands	4.36	4.36	0.00
Austria	3.24	0.00	3.24
Norway	1.93	0.00	1.93
Total	18.59	11.06	7.93

Source: IDA, *Civil Service Reform Programme Status Report, 5, 1995*

The review exercise led to the adoption of a number of measures. Among them are down-sizing and retrenchment aimed at controlling public spending and civil service staffing levels, salary increases supported with job evaluation and grading, monetization of non-cash benefits, training of staff, introduction of results-oriented management, communication strategy and public relations, and lastly decentralization.

To date, the measures implemented are down sizing and retrenchment, decentralization, and salary enhancement. The cost containment efforts (down sizing and retrenchment have taken a variety of forms - ranging from the removal of "ghost" workers from the payroll, through the freezing of vacancies, to the retrenchment of civil servants, and the restructuring of ministries and district administrations. Salary enhancement programmes have addressed specific pay conditions for civil servants in an attempt to remove distortions in government renumeration structures and building institutional capacity in the government to formulate and implement performance-oriented salary policies.

IV. Customer Service as an Element of the Ugandan Civil Service Reform Programme

At first glance, the design of the 1989 programme would appear to address the short- as well as the long-term goals of civil service reform. However, a closer analysis shows that the linkages between the design and the

objectives are not sufficiently strong and the design does not facilitate easy realization of the long-term goals of the programme. The point to note here is that customer service is a complex and protracted exercise which should have been emphasized right from the implementation of the first element of the reform programme. In other words, all elements should aim at, and have a direct link with, customer service. Yet, when we analyze the retrenchment element, we are likely to discover that the link between the two was not seriously considered by the authors of the reform programme. For instance, retrenchment of 'group employees' (i.e. ancillary office staff such as cleaners and receptionists) will not necessarily result in improved delivery of services to the public.

Of recent, the Ugandan government has awakened to the fact that the reform programme should now shift from the inward-looking orientation of the first stage to a customer-oriented approach. The aim is to bring about real improvements in service delivery through the building and strengthening of human and institutional capacity and the introduction of results-oriented and total quality management techniques.

The new approach to the delivery of services in government calls for a business approach to running the affairs of state, and requires the application of marketing and production techniques to the field of public administration.

It is undeniable that every business has an image to protect. Besides, successful business enterprises have realized that a positive image does not just happen. It is the result of a lot of planning, hard work, and doing a number of things consistently well. In emulating business enterprises, government is at a disadvantage because of the problems of size, the decision making process, and the multiplicity of constituencies that government officials must account to.

The adoption of structural adjustment policies may yet have a positive or negative impact on customer relations in government. For instance, it has been noted that while injecting a dose of seriousness in the management of public resources and bringing public officials face-to-face with the realities of the market place structural adjustment programmes exposed civil servants to hardship and deprivation, increased the incidence of ethical violations, and undermined civil service morale. In the Uganda civil service, SAP brought about a feeling of insecurity among civil servants. Public officers tended to

fear that they might be thrown out at any time. As such, a few of them aimed at personal accumulation, so that by the time they left the service, they would have something to fall back on. The question is how such people could be persuaded to have 'customer service' on top of their agenda.

Effective customer service largely depends on the morale of the workers and their ability to win customer confidence. Building a winning team requires a positive response to the needs of all the employees who provide the service. This is because in order to get things done, motivation of employees is a key factor. Motivation is the internal force that makes people move towards satisfying a need. Care should be taken to ensure that a fair and constantly updated system of rewards is established since, as Maslow's theory indicates, people's needs differ.

Despite the hindrances referred to earlier, the Uganda government has made an effort to improve customer satisfaction in its delivery of services. The measures adopted range from decentralization to the establishment of watch-dog bodies.

Decentralization

The term decentralization has been defined as the transfer of the legal, administrative, and political authority to make decisions and manage public functions from the central government to field organizations, subordinate units of government, semi autonomous public corporations, area-wide development authorities, functional authorities, autonomous local governments, or nongovernmental organizations. Decentralization may take the form of devolution or deconcentration. For the purpose of our analysis, emphasis will be placed on devolution, which was Uganda's main response, although some of the transitional arrangements, such as the creation of District votes in the national budget, are legacies of deconcentration. The transitional measures, in any case, have a limited time frame. Under the devolution plan, the central government decided to transfer to local governments decision-making authority with regard to the formulation and implementation of select development projects, and the mobilization as well as allocation of the required resources. The local government units in Uganda therefore have become largely independent of the central government.

Decentralization in Uganda has improved the responsiveness of the civil service to the needs of the people. This has resulted from the local administration's close interaction with its clients as well as the latter's direct influence on local administrative decisions. Improved communication between the 'local leaders' and the citizenry has created conditions favourable to local participation in the decision-making process.

It is however, important to note that the decentralized power can be hijacked by autocratic and opportunistic elites at the District, county, sub county and the parish levels. When this happens, customer service and citizen involvement in local administration will be hampered. It is gratifying to note that Article 176 (3) of Uganda's Constitution seeks to entrench democracy at the local level:

The system of Local Government shall be based on democratically elected Councils on the basis of universal adult suffrage in accordance with clause 4 Article 181 of this constitution.

Clause 4 of article 181 provides that all local government councils shall be elected every four years. In addition, a District Council is empowered to pass a vote of censure against a member of the District Executive Committee if they are dissatisfied with his/her conduct or performance. Above all, according to Article 182 (1) of the Uganda Constitution, the mandate of an elected member of a local government council may be revoked by the electorate following a procedure which Parliament shall prescribe.

Decentralization is, therefore, not simply a policy goal meant to shift responsibility for development to local authorities but also a policy instrument aimed at improving local democracy, accountability, efficiency, equity, effectiveness and sustainability in the provision of social services countrywide. Decentralization's relevance to the civil service reform programme in Uganda is critical in as far as it affects staffing and personnel management in general. Most central government departments have been decentralized to the districts.

Results oriented Management System

Results-oriented management was introduced in the Uganda civil service in December 1995. This technique, if well implemented, will allow the service to clearly define its objectives, and to organize how and when the components

of these objectives will be achieved by each ministry, by the various departments within each ministry, and by the individual civil servants. Results-oriented management calls for regular performance appraisal and evaluation.

The civil service has organized a series of sensitization, team building and action planning workshops to chart out realistic and measurable performance standards, as well as indicators to guide Districts and Ministries in their service delivery to the public. An example is the Permanent Secretaries' Seminar held in December 1995 in Mbarara, Western Uganda.

The principle of continuous improvement has been accepted. This is based on the premise that quality and quantity are not the only measure of public service performance standard. Users' opinions are a major guide, and this calls for effective communication between service providers and consumers, and for an effective accountability system.

Capacity Building

The Uganda government in November 1985 embarked on an institutional capacity building project to strengthen the capacities of personnel and improve processes within central and local government. The overall aim of the project is to improve the efficiency and efficacy of service delivery by central and local government. As part of its institutional capacity building project, the Uganda government, through the Administrative Reform Commission of the Ministry of Public Service, carried out a baseline service delivery survey, with the support of the World Bank. The purposes of this baseline service delivery survey were to develop a suitable methodology and establish a framework of sample sites throughout Uganda; to gather baseline data on key services that could form the basis of performance evaluation; and to build evaluative capacities within central and local government in Uganda.

The services selected for the baseline survey were those provided to rural communities by the Ministries of Health, Agriculture, and Animal Industry and Fisheries (especially Agricultural Extension Services and District Farm Institutes). In addition, the customs services provided to the business community by the Uganda Revenue Authority were selected for evaluation.

Because this survey is still at its early stages, it is difficult to asses the extent to which capacity has been enhanced. But it can be said that the results

will provide some initial data on coverage, impact and perceptions of government services and on some potential performance indicators for those services. The survey is expected to produce actionable results and to contribute to the building of evaluative capacities at national and district levels.

Watch-dog Bodies

The Uganda government has established various agencies aimed at ensuring good conduct in the implementation of government policies and provision of public services. The Inspector General of Government, who can be equated with the Ombudsman, the Public Accounts Committee, and the Auditor General all have powers to audit the conduct and performance of the civil servants. The general public is encouraged to forward its complaints to any of these bodies which in turn can summon public servants and question them on issues such as financial accountability, service delivery and response to public grievances.

Conclusion

To improve the standard of living of the people while also ensuring social justice, Government should have up-to-date information on its customers' wishes in a continuously changing environment. For the citizens to make full use of improved services, it is also necessary to have effective communication in place. Information technology offers the prospect of better access and inter-connectivity.

Customer service can be further enhanced if public officers view their activities through the customers' eyes. Government should attempt to satisfy its customers, treating them not as numbers but as individuals with specific needs.

Effective customer service calls for political will, bureaucratic support, and respect for the needs and demands of the public. It can be said that so far, the current Uganda government is committed to bringing about improved customer service relations. However, mechanisms should be instituted to ensure continuity even if the current political leadership is not in place. It is the commitment of the bureaucracy which will ensure this continuity. That means the needs of the various cadres of the civil service should also be addressed.

REFERENCES

1. A.F. Leemans (1976), "Overviews", in A.F. Leemans (ed.) *TheManagement of Change in Government*, The Hague, Martinus Njihoff.

2. Gerald E. Caiden (1969), *Administrative Reform*, Chicago, Aldine Publishing company.

3. F.W. Riggs, ed. (1970), *Frontiers of Development Administration*, Durham, N.C., Duke university Press.

4. Caiden, Administrative Reform, op.cit.

5. Y.Dror (1971), *Ventures in Policy Sciences*, New York, Elsevier.

6. M.J. Balogun (1996) "Political and Economic Liberalization in Africa: a Critical Review of Trends and a Capacity Building Proposal", *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 62 (3), September 1996.

7. Quoted in A. Rweyemamu and G. Hyden (1975), *A Decade of Public Administration in Africa*, Nairobi, East African Literature Bureau.

8. ibid

9. With the promulgation of the Uganda Constitution in 1995, the NRA was re-named the Uganda Peoples Defence Force (UPDF)

10. *Report of the Public Service Review and Reorganization Commission*, 1991, Government of Uganda.

11. B. Nunberg (1995) "Civil Service Reform and the World Bank", World Bank Discussion Paper, Washington D.C.

12. The Ten-Point Programme is a slender document which outlines the social, political and economic development goals which the NRM set out to achieve when it came to power in 1986.

13. Government of Uganda, (1993) *Management of Change: Report of the seminar for Ministers and Permanent Secretaries*, Kampala.

14. W.N. Wamalwa (1989) "The impact of Structural Adjustment Programs on the Performance of Africa's Public Service", in M. Jide Balogun and G. Mutahaba (eds.) *Economic Restructuring and African Public Administration*, West Hartford, Kumarian Press Inc.

15. B. Mulokozi, W.H. Shellukindo, and R. Baguma (1989) "The Adaptation of Government to Economic Change: A Case Stufy of Tanzania", in Balogun and Mutahaba, op.cit.

16. Gelase Mutahaba (1989) *Reforming Public Administration for Development: Experience from East Africa*, West Hartford, Kumarian Press Inc.

17. Government of Uganda (1995) "Draft Report of Baseline service Survey", Kampala

THE CORE ELEMENTS OF CIVIL SERVICE REFORM

Robert Dodoo

Introduction

Public services have a major role to play in the overall development of Africa, especially at this stage in our socio-economic development, and as we are about to usher in the 21st century. Currently, almost all the socio-economic indicators point to the fact that most African states are among the least developed and developing nations of the world. In response to the situation, almost all the countries of Africa have embarked on, and are at various stages of, economic recovery and structural adjustment reforms. Indeed, African leaders, faced with rising expectations, and under tremendous pressures to improve the living conditions of their peoples, have developed "visions", plans and strategies aimed at accelerating the pace of growth and development. Ghana, for instance, has produced its own socio-economic development blueprint designated "Ghana-Vision 2000".

To be specific, African leaders are striving to achieve accelerated economic, socio-cultural and political development and to emulate the socio-economic miracles of Asia. Their objectives generally have been to:

(i) attain and sustain a growth rate of about 8 to 12 percent;
(ii) reduce the currently high rate of inflation;
(iii) improve the management of natural and human resources;
(iv) develop the public sector and enhance its capacity to attain strategic development objectives;
(v) strengthen and support the private sector which generally is acknowledged as a principal engine of growth; and
(vi) substantially improve the living standards of the people.

The reforms of the public services have therefore been directed towards attaining the preceding objectives. Indeed, efforts geared towards the attainment of the strategic objectives, and towards the implementation of the appropriate incentive schemes, constitute, or, should be taken as, the core elements of civil service reform.

I. Public Service Reform priorities

To achieve the objectives referred to earlier, the role of the public service has to be redefined and refocussed. African states require dedicated public servants committed to assisting the government and the peoples of Africa to:

(a) provide relevant and effective policy advice;
(b) formulate and expeditiously implement decisions, programmes and plans; and
(c) improve operational systems and procedures to foster a customer-service orientation, and contribute to enhanced living conditions.

In Africa, public service institutions have attempted to function as policy formulation and implementing agencies, and to deliver, rather ineffectively, goods and services which properly belong within the commercial private sector. There is need a draw a clear distinction between traditional, and non conventional public service functions, and to allow the private sector to take up some of the current functions. This trend is now beginning to be noticeable in current reform initiatives. This will have tremendous impact on the public services and enable them to be more efficient, and to produce better results.

Public Service Ethos

The typical post-independence public service was modelled on the metropolitan system. The British in particular, left a set of core principles which defined an ideal civil service. Among the attributes bequeathed by the British are those of:

- political impartiality, and non partisanship;
- loyalty, dedication and commitment to the service of the government of the day, and the people;
- professionalism; and
- adherence to rules, regulations, administrative instructions/General Orders and application of same in a fair, and equitable manner.

The inherited civil service was effective not only in maintaining law and order, but also in serving the post-colonial state. It was a pride to belong to it. Over the years, however, and particularly in the last twenty years, the decline in both the performance and esteem of the public service has been

phenomenal. There is therefore the need to re-visit, and enforce the fundamental principles that shape the character and exemplify the standard of the public service. This entails focusing on structural, political, and financial impediments to efficiency and effectiveness.

Bureaucratic Structures

The growth in structures and numbers for one, have led to huge bureaucracies with the attendant inefficiency, falling productivity, red-tapism, and systemic corruption. The bloated and rigid structures must be dismantled, reduced in size, and decentralized to ensure the emergence of a citizen-responsive public service.

Political Instability

Africa is said to be going through a period of transition. Wars and military interventions have taken a heavy toll on the performance of the public service not only in terms of numbers lost through deaths or brain-drain, but as measured by the will and capacity of the average public servant to offer frank advice and serve with integrity. The politicization of the public service (with the attendant intrigues, mistrust, and mutual black-mail) has undermined the *esprit de corps* of the civil service, as well as its capacity to deliver basic services.

Financial Resources

The public services in Africa continue to be denied the financial resources needed to operate effectively and efficiently. With most of the African economies in decline in the last two decades, the public services have had to do with rapidly decreasing resources. The impact of this has been noticeable in almost every sphere of life. Essential services have either been sharply curtailed, or poorly delivered. Workers' salaries (where they are not in arrears) have been reduced to pea-nuts, with the negative consequences for dedication, ethical uprightness, and morale.

Training and Retraining

The breakdown of the human resources management function in the public service is clearly reflected in improper career development and severe gaps in the training of officials. For instance, training in critical areas do not

exist, and where they exist, could not be funded. This has resulted in severe skills shortages, particularly, in areas such as policy analysis, financial management, performance management, management information system, and computer applications to programme planning and management.

The situation has been confounded by brain drain and skills erosion. Due largely to the prevailing atmosphere in a number of countries and within the public services, highly qualified and competent professionals have migrated to Europe and America, or have been absorbed by the various international organizations, thus depriving the public services in Africa the much-needed human resources. As things are, some of the traditional principles of public service management such as adherence to open and competitive recruitment standards, application of merit criteria in the selection and promotion of staff, and the indexing of careers to training, have somewhat been compromised.

These erstwhile qualities of the African public service which have been lost or eroded during the past two decades must be restored to ensure the re emergence of unalloyed, dedicated service, efficiency and productivity. The issues that arise from years of institutional decay must also be identified as elements to be addressed in all reform programmes.

II. Civil Service Reform in Ghana: Main Thrusts

African nations and their public services are confronted by problems and issues of contemporary and future relevance. During the past decade, the governments of Ghana, Uganda and, indeed, many other African countries, have examined the issues of the structure, poor performance or low productivity and remuneration in the public sector, and have initiated programmes aimed at addressing these concerns. The early phase of the Civil Service Reform Programme (CSRP) in Ghana was intended to address, in part, these issues. CSRP focussed on the following reform components and elements:

i. *Personnel Policy and Management*: revision of schemes of service, with emphasis on elements such as the introduction and institutionalization of the performance appraisal system, manpower budget hearings, and enactment of a new civil service law and administrative instructions;
ii. *Incomes Policy and Salary Administration*: the focus was on reforming and rationalizing the pay and grading structures, linking pay to

productivity, undertaking merit pay studies, embarking on comprehensive job evaluation studies aimed at establishing realistic pay differentials and introducing other incentive packages;

iii. *Management services*: this had become almost defunct and had to be restored through the training of personnel in management services functions, the provision of logistics, the commissioning of regular organization and methods reviews, staff inspection, management and efficiency audits;

iv. *Labour Redeployment or Rationalization*: this was aimed at reducing the size and cost of the public service, and was the centre-piece of the entire reform effort. The social consequences were not immediately and seriously considered until at a later stage;

v. *Training and Manpower Development*: This emphasized the need to develop an overall training policy and to conduct training programmes with a view to improving the quality of personnel in the service;

vi. *An integrated Payroll and Personnel Database Project*: This was to ensure the availability of accurate personnel and payroll data to enhance decision making and management performance. It was one of the essential, but late, additions to the reform programme in Ghana;

vii. *Records Management and Improvement*: Aimed at ensuring proper storage, retrieval and maintenance of records from creation to disposition, this component of the CSRP focussed on the restructuring of registry and record management services in the public service.

The Impact of CSRP

The public sector reform components and elements outlined above and initiated during the past decade, achieved only limited success, due to a number of circumstances. The earliest phase of the civil service reform programme in Ghana as in most of the other African countries, was initiated as a component, and within the context, of an economic restructuring programme which was supported by the major international donor agencies. The civil service reform aspects of structural adjustment programmes were mostly constrained by donor time-tables, agenda and conditionalities.

While the reform elements in African countries were identical, the opportunity to share experiences were very limited. The public services were, in some instances drastically trimmed down, ostensibly to save cost, and to pay competitive wages. This proved to be a mirage. The reforms did not

enhance overall performance, and did not bring about the expected transparency, accountability and good governance in public management. Besides, it did not improve service to the people and to the private sector. It was also limited in scope and coverage, hence its limited impact and lack of commitment from civil servants. Most of the essential reform outputs are yet to become an integral part of the culture of management, and to result in increased productivity and performance improvement in the civil service.

III. The Public Sector National Institutional Renewal (NIRP)

The experiences gained under the CSRP informed the new, inward-propelled strategy of civil service reform adopted in Ghana in recent years. The new reform initiative, the Public Sector National Institution Renewal Programme (NIRP) with its major new component, the Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP) was designed with a view to addressing the core issues of economic growth and development, improved service delivery, efficiency, cost-effectiveness, and public sector productivity. They explain the programme's tilt towards the enhancement of institutional and human capacity, performance management, accountability, and good governance.

The civil service reform component of NIRP has the following characteristics:

- the search for efficiency
- the desire to imbibe a service orientation in public officials
- the need to be accountable and transparent in dealing with the tax payer and the citizenry at large;
- the focus on cost-effectiveness and value-for-money;
- the necessity to be market-oriented and thereby "customer-friendly"; and above all
- the attention accorded to the over riding goal of good governance.

Basic Principles

To achieve these reform objectives and to avoid the mistakes of the past, the management of the public service was to be based on a new set of principles. Under the emerging paradigm, the top-down approach gave way to a bottom-up orientation. Consensus building began to be emphasized to

allow each major stakeholder to co-determine aspects of the overall policy design and to interpret its own role in the process. Consensus building was also used to create an understanding among the different stakeholders, particularly when reform entailed far reaching changes in the bureaucratic system as a whole.

Output and performance orientation was also emphasized as a guiding principle of the CSPIP design. The organization rank-and-file collectively determined the solutions to problems as well as the strategies adopted. The underlying principles, as noted earlier, are participation, consensus building, and collective "ownership" of the entire reform process. It is no longer a situation in which a group of experts, high level committees or commissions design a programme and then pass it on to the government or, to the civil servants, for implementation.

In short, the new paradigm seeks, among other things to :

a) change the centralist and "command" orientation of the civil service to a decentralized, performance- and output oriented system - a system which puts its customer/client (the citizens, government, private sector) first;
b) ensure commitment to the programme and create a sense of ownership.

Ghana's experience further testifies to the need to plan and implement civil service reform within the context of clearly defined strategic objectives. The government's vision of society serves as a mandate for, and guides, civil service performance.

Basic Instruments

The CSPIP had to rely on basic research instruments which had been largely ignored in the past. These include:

(i) Institutional Self-Appraisal,
(ii) Beneficiary Surveys
(iii) Diagnostic Workshops
(iv) Performance Improvement Plans
(v) Plan Implementation Programming and Sequencing
(vi) Periodic Monitoring and Review.

Institutional Self-Appraisal Instruments

In line with the CSPIP principle of self diagnosis, a questionnaire entitled the Institutional Self Appraisal Instrument was designed and administered in all ministries, departments and agencies. The Instrument was not simply to elicit responses, but to give the institutions an opportunity to undertake an indepth, corporate self-analysis, with particular emphasis on their strengths, weaknesses, opportunities as well as threats encountered within the environment, available resources, processes and activities, outputs, mission and goals, and the interrelationship among the various parameters and variables. This process was co ordinated by an in-house Capacity Development Team in each agency.

Beneficiary Surveys

An important innovation under CSPIP is the emphasis on beneficiary surveys. This process of systematically consulting clients of the public service is aimed at assessing the impact of the services rendered, setting standards, and meeting the expectations of the public. The process should introduce a new dynamism into policy formulation and programme execution, and make it possible for the public to be regularly consulted for their views on the level, quality and quantity of services offered. It should also make the Civil Service increasingly responsive to public demands.

Diagnostic Workshops (DW)

These workshops constitute the final stages of the CSPIP's bottom-up cycle of activities. Essentially, they help diagnose capacity problems in the civil service with a view to enhancing the level of performance and improving service delivery capacity.

In the course of the workshops, references are made to the results of beneficiary surveys and the self-appraisal studies. The workshops are organized to respond to four basic questions:

- Where are we now, what are we doing right and wrong?
- Where are we going? What do we want in the future?

- How are we going to get there? i.e., the strategies we will follow to achieve our goals, to enhance performance, and improve the incentive/ reward system.
- The next Steps - actions and changes in perception and orientation.

These questions invariably led to the identification of institutional strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, resulting in the formulation and implementation of performance/productivity improvement plans.

Performance Improvement Plans (PIP)

The three instruments referred to earlier were used at the capacity diagnosis stage of CSPIP. This was followed by the capacity development stage at which each public service agency was required to develop a time-bound Performance Improvement Plan with clear objectives (consistent with National and Sector Goals) and well-documented programmes, projects and work plans showing expected outputs. This plan is to incorporate the changes deemed necessary during the diagnosis stage. These performance plans would then be implemented incrementally until a culture of performance, cost consciousness, and client responsiveness was developed.

Plans Implementation (PI)

With the preparation of the PIP, ministries and departments were expected to begin the process of internal restructuring, taking into account the standards developed and agreed with the government. In the course of implementing programmes and projects, they might decide to contract out, privatize certain services, or transfer certain functions to local communities or non-governmental organizations.

At the same time, system-wide issues identified at the diagnostic stage as constraining performance were to be tackled by the central government agencies. This sometimes entailed changing the rules and regulations, or finding the resources required to implement aspects of the reform programme.

Periodic Monitoring and Review

Finally, to ensure that the results of the reforms were sustained, periodic reviews were undertaken. These are of two types:

- Review/monitoring of activities by donors and by the managers of the reform and
- Institutional Review

Results of Diagnostic Exercises

So far, some of the findings emanating from the application of the preceding methodologies attest to the efficacy of the new approach in addressing the real issues, viz: public sector institutional capacity development, resource utilization, and good governance. They have, at least, resulted in highlighting sector specific and system-wide performance management problems.

For example, the Self Appraisal Instrument revealed that:

- only 50 per cent of the Ministries produced concise Mission Statements; only 36 per cent of Ministries appeared to be familiar with the latest government policies impacting on their Mission Statements;
- only 18 per cent of Mission statements specifically referred to efficiency;
- 45 per cent of the Ministries did not refer to the need to regularly review their Mission Statements.

The preceding data was factored into the CSPIP's diagnostic workshops, and this prompted Ministries to produce clear, concise, up-to-date and relevant Mission Statements taking current government policies into account.

The evaluation of the Self-appraisal Instruments further revealed that certain management practices hampered efficiency in the service. It became clear, for instance, that there was too much centralization of authority. Approximately 23 per cent of the ministries made this observation, and 18 percent indicated that they did not have adequate authority to manage resources.

Among other weaknesses which the studies revealed are:

- duplication of functions;
- need to critically examine manpower levels;
- absence of, and the need to develop, Performance/Productivity Improvement Plans based on prevailing policies and programmes;
- the need for performance standards, performance measurement, and performance monitoring;
- the lack of correlation between performance and incentives, and;
- shortage of skills in some critical areas (with 59 percent of Ministries reporting this);
- lack of funds for basic operations and logistics support (73 percent of the ministries);
- regular short-fall in the approved budget (99 percent).

Conclusion

African public services have for too long based their reform plans on the agendas of external donors. As we approach the 21st century, we must adopt our own new orientation to issues of human and institutional capacity building, productivity/performance management, and good governance. Ghana is currently addressing issues of immediate and direct concern in public service reform. Perhaps how it follows through its institution renewal strategies and methodologies would serve as an objective lesson in the implementation of an inward propelled strategy of public and civil service reform.

CIVIL SERVICE REFORM PRIORITIES IN A NEW NATION: FOCUS ON NAMIBIA

M.F. Cupido

Namibia obtained its independence in 1991 but the impact of the changes since 1964 when the South African occupation regime started its own brand of civil service reform in Namibia is still felt today and the newly independent state is still struggling with this legacy. The period 1964 - 1980 was one of divide and rule; 1980 -1990, the interim government; and 1990 - 1996, independence. This paper will attempt to describe efforts at civil service reform, at setting ethical standards and promoting accountability and good governance. It will touch on efforts at tackling the critical shortage of skills and solving the problems encuntered in fostering the needed customer service orientation.

I. Evolution of Namibian Public Service

Colonial era: 1964 - 1980

The resistance to the South African government in Namibia started in earnest during the 1960's. This period also saw the first attempt at the "indigenization" of government, with Namibia being used as a laboratory for testing South Africa's policies of divide-and-rule. Thus in 1964, parts of the country were divided into tribal homelands as recommended by the Odendaal Commission. This resulted in the segregation of the Namibian population into eleven ethnic groups and the carving up of black communities into linguistic and tribal blocs. The whites were, despite their different origins, seen as a homogeneous group. Each black community was administered by a tribal authority with a white secretary who was accountable to the central administration. The population was led to believe that this was the first step towards self-government and decentralization. In fact, by its very nature, and as a brainchild of apartheid, it was riddled with inequalities, corruption and nepotism. Waste of human and financial resources became the order of the day. It was also a very paternalistic system which transferred minimum skills to the indigenous people. The period from 1964 to 1980 saw a number of changes, with South Africa transferring various powers to the then South West African Administration.

Transition to Independence

In 1980 a central administration was set up with sixteen departments and ten other racially and ethnically defined second-tier administrations.

The central administration was under the control of the Administrator-General. An independent Government Service Commission with executive powers was established in place of the South African public Service Commission. Namibia was then faced with the anomalous situation whereby an ostensibly independent public service was expected to operate in a country which was not yet independent. Amidst all this confusion, there was the Administration for Whites with the resources and skills needed to administer the whole country concentrated in the hands of a few privileged white officials who were transferred from South Africa. The whole administration was geared towards appeasing those settlers who had worked for the South West African administration, with the ethnic authorities basically left to their own devices.

Post Independence Reform Priorities

The advent of Independence in 1991 found Namibia's public service in a state of chaos and uncertainty. The incoming government found a plethora of administrations adhering to the ideology of apartheid -- agencies whose success was measured in terms of their capacity to implement South African policies, and which showed little concern for service, transparency, accountability or democracy. There is still up to the present day a belief that the public service is a job for life -- that once you are in, you cannot easily be removed. Ethical and performance standards were unheard of, especially in the ethnic administrations where allegiance to the occupation regime was the primary determinant of public servants' tenure.

The independent Namibian government faced the unenviable task of reconstituting the central departments and the second-tier administrations into a unified Public Service of Namibia. This reconstruction was carried out as a matter of great urgency after independence and was based on the recommendations of the Report of the Committee on the Reconstruction of the Public Service of 16 March 1990, as well as the provisions of the Namibian Constitution (Article 141 (1), which stipulates that a person holding office on the date of independence shall continue to hold such office unless and until he/she resigns or is retired, transferred or removed from office in accordance

with the law. While this stipulation in the constitution assisted the new government to retain the much-needed expertise and skills, it also saddled the new civil service with a lot of dead wood--people who were just biding their time until they retired with generous benefits. This was not at all in harmony with the aims and objectives of the new government.

While Namibia was previously administered as a colony of South Africa, the basic governmental functions were carried out by specialist departments and not by multi-purpose ministries. On independence, new ministries had to be established to perform the functions of government; e.g. foreign affairs, information and broadcasting, lands resettlement and rehabilitation, trade and industry, amongst others. The erstwhile departments were then regrouped under the still evolving ministerial structure.

Another problem the newly independent government encountered at independence was that the indigenous population (including women) were seriously under-represented in the public service. 90 percent of all promotion posts were filled by white males. The government also faced a crisis of expectations. As a developing country the government has a social obligation to provide services such as health care, social welfare, housing and education, all of which were sadly neglected during the colonial era. The officials who were to design the new programmes were however, viewed with suspicion, particularly, as they were identified with the previous regime. The new government's major task was how to transform the newly unified administration into a body that was representative of the majority of the people, while retaining the services of the skilled and experienced, mainly white, officials.

This problem has since been addressed by the implementation of a policy of affirmative action to redress the imbalances of the past, and also to give Namibian citizens a sense of ownership over their own administration. Consequently there was super-imposed on this administration a layer of senior appointments drawn from the ranks of formerly exiled Namibians and previously neglected sections of the community. This was the case with the post of Permanent Secretary down to that of deputy director in each ministry.

While the management cadre became more representative, the direct supervisory level (forming the middle layer) remained largely untouched. Thus another abnormal situation arose. The supervisory posts were occupied by long-serving officials who were sandwiched between the few black Namibians

in top posts and the large number of blacks in lower-level, subordinate positions. This led to a situation whereby formal chains of command were short-circuited, with public servants in lower ranks by-passing supervisors because they found a sympathetic ear higher up. Some even sought and obtained direct access to political office-bearers. At the same time, those employees who chose to operate within the formal organization structure found themselves blocked by sometimes rigid and intransigent superiors. This bred further distrust and mutual suspicion.

It should also be noted that many of the affirmative action appointees tended to be academically brilliant, but with little or no experience. The Public Service Act of 1980 was amended by the Namibian Parliament in order to accommodate the new entrants. All the same, the new entrants had to rely on their longer-serving colleagues for the interpretation of basic operational rules from Afrikaans into English. It must be noted that the tradition in the pre independence civil service had been to stick rigidly to written rules which could not be changed without a formal decision at a superior level of authority, usually the Public Service Commission.

Many of the apartheid-era officials found the parameters of their work changed as a result of the demands of the new ministerial structure and also because of the new competencies brought into the civil service by a new generation of managers who had international exposure. We must bear in mind that Namibia, like South Africa, was emerging from years of isolation and its administrators largely reflected this narrow vision. Many of the apartheid-era civil servants (white and black) did not possess high academic qualifications, with matric/grade 12 being the entry qualification for the non-professionals occupational classes. They were, however, in possession of invaluable experience and knowledge of how the system functioned. The new incumbents, in contrast felt superior because of their impressive qualifications. They also distrusted some of their apartheid-era colleagues because of their close identification with the previous regime.

Lack of know-how and insecurity as to what the future holds left most people in the civil service unsure about the framework within which they should operate. This reinforced the attitude of mutual distrust already evident in the early years of independence.

Role of Public Service Commission

The Namibian Constitution established an independent and impartial Public Service Commission with the primary purpose of advising the President and the government on appointments, the exercise of discipline over such appointees, their renumeration and retirement benefits. The constitution also envisages that the Public Service Commission would advise Government on all other matters "which by law pertain to the Public Service" and to perform all functions assigned to it by Act of Parliament. The true constitutional importance of the Public Service Commission lies in it being a check on possible abuse by government functionaires, particularly, in matters relating to public service appointments, renumeration, and discipline. Up to the implementation of the new Public Service Act at the end of 1995, it was perceived that the Public Service Commission had operated as if it still managed the Public Service on the model of the old Government Service Commission much to the frustration of ministries and the new appointees, who felt they were being thwarted by bureaucratic intransigence. With the promulgation of the Public Service Act, No. 13, 1995, the role of the Public Service Commission was brought in line with the constitution. Under the new Act, the Prime Minister is charged with the responsibility for the management of the Public Service, and the Commission will advise the Prime Minister as deemed necessary. The new act also provides for the delegation of authority to ministries and departments.

Size and Cost of the Civil Service

The Namibian Public Service increased to alarming proportions, reaching an all time high of 3.9 per cent of the total population and with the salary bill constituting 54.5 per cent of the total budget by the end of 1995. This uncontrolled growth can be ascribed to the inherited inefficiency, compounded by the recruitment of many inexperienced public servants, and also the fact that many now saw the government as the main source of employment. Like most African countries emerging from wars of liberation, the government was also faced with the former combatants (unskilled and untrained) clamouring for jobs in government. In order to meet their demand, many had to be absorbed in the police and armed forces.

It should be noted that the present definition of the public service was established in 1980 by a proclamation issued by the then Administrator-General.

At the moment, the term embraces everyone employed in a ministry or public office. The problem with this definition is that it lumps together a number of disparate groups, i.e., groups with quite different characteristics and problems. In particular, the term includes the central administration (which I will call the "civil service"), the uniformed services, the teaching service, and the health workers. The salary budget for Namibia comprises all those subject to the Public Service Act and all political office bearers. Excluded are the staff of the parastatals.

III. Civil Service Reform: Achievement and problems

As early as 1991 the government of Namibia recognized that it was essential for good governance, cost effectiveness and efficiency to review the performance of the existing structures and to stem the further expansion of the Public Service. At its second special meeting held in the coastal town of Swakopmund on 14 and 15 December 1992, The Namibian cabinet recognized that steps would have to be taken to control the growth of the public service and, in so doing, reduce public expenditure. It equally recognized that urgent and immediate action was needed to address the issues of duplication of functions among ministries and generally the pressing need to improve public service performance. The cabinet therefore resolved, inter alia, that offices/ministries closely examine aspects of the Rationalization Report of November 1992 which were relevant to them, and submit rationalization proposals. The objectives were:

(a) Ensuring optimum efficiency in the operations of the Office/Ministry concerned, identifying as appropriate, some of its functions and resultant operations which may give rise to duplication with those performed by another Office/Ministry, and to make recommendations on how to best resolve such duplications;
(b) Streamlining the operations of the Office/Ministry, with a view to delineating clear lines of authority and improving channels of communication;
(c) Examining all vacant posts on the establishment to ascertain if those posts are really necessary and, if not recommend their abolition;
(d) Identifying redundant posts on their establishments and recommend the discharge, in terms of the Public Service Act, of the incumbents and the consequent abolition of redundant posts thus identified.

The 1992 Rationalization report had recommended far-reaching changes in the public service. In some instances, it proposed the abolition of entire ministries thus reducing the size of the civil service by almost 50 per cent. Namibia learned many expensive lessons out of its earlier efforts at downsizing the public service. The 1992 rationalization proposals were found unacceptable for a number of reasons but mostly because of its top-down approach and lack of consultation at the ministerial level. It also did not take into consideration the sensitive political climate in which the public service operated so soon after independence. Namibia's independence was only two years old. Such drastic cuts in personnel did not fit in with the political and social imperatives of the day and, so failed to garner support within government circles.

Expecting Permanent Secretaries to look objectively at their own staffing complements also turned out to be unrealistic. The first effort at rationalization failed dismally because the existing authorized complement of a ministry was taken into account rather than the actual staff in post. The net outcome was the creation of additional posts.

Still mindful of the consequences of its bloated civil service, the cabinet, on 14 November 1995, approved proposals for downsizing the public service. The cabinet decided that the following policy measures be introduced to lower the budget deficit:

(i) Disallow all additional requests for funds, especially for personnel expenditure;
(ii) Freeze external recruitment, (except recruitment to highly skilled and professional posts), take measures to implement an early retirement scheme and allow only internal recruitment to fill existing vacancies;
(iii) Between 1995 and 1997, bring down the share of the personnel expenditure further to 40 per cent or less of the total budget;
(iv) Within the same 1995 - 1997 period, consider further streamlining of the functions of government with a view to containing the growth of current expenditure and improving the overall efficiency of the public service.

It is evident that after six years of independence, Namibia still finds itself in the throes of reform and change. Several valuable improvements in organization both between and within ministries flowed from the exercise, but the size of the public service remained unchanged.

Challenges to Management

The aftermath of Namibia's efforts at reform brought about its own set of problems. Although a code of conduct is in existence and disciplinary action is provided for in the Public Service Act, enforcement proved difficult for managers. A reluctance by managers to act decisively in cases where strong disciplinary action was needed has been ascribed to various factors, among others, wilful obstruction of state machinery by those who would like to see government fail or, ignorance on the part of new managers as to the legality of their actions. Another reason for the failure of management, particularly, the tendency to misuse government property and wilful disregard of ethical standards, can also be ascribed to the way remuneration issues were handled after independence. The government inherited a pay policy which resulted in a wide gap between lowly paid (mostly black) employees and highly paid (mostly white) officers. Government had to do away with the discrimination, and it has to address the salary position of the lowly paid public servants who are in the majority. These groups were therefore singled out for pay increases together with certain occupational classes. The promulgation of the Labour Act in 1992 also did not bring much relief, since public servants could through their unions bargain for higher salaries. Some groups did well for themselves but the management cadre, which is at the top of the more or less 262 occupational classes, did less well than any other group, and is at the moment seriously out of line with their counterparts in other parts of the world.

VI. A new direction

On 18 January 1995 a Wage and Salary Commission was established to undertake a fundamental review of public service pay. This Commission completed its task within 9 months. The Commission was made up of Mr. Melvyn Jeremiah as Chairman, and Dr. M. Jide Balogun, Ms. M.F. Cupido, Mr. Eric Knouwds, and Mr. Andrew Matjila as members. Its terms of reference covered the whole area of public service management. It also submitted recommendations on, among other topics, a code of conduct for public servants and parliamentarians, the size of the civil service, and privatization. This report has in principle been accepted by cabinet and should be implemented as early as 1 April 1996. The chairman of the commission, Mr. Melvyn Jeremiah, in presenting the final report to the Prime Minister, Mr. Hage Goingob, said:

"The Public Service in Namibia is now at a turning point. For the past five years since Independence it has been re-adjusting to its new role, with the twin poles of Reconciliation and Affirmative Action shaping the personnel corps to a form more capable of playing it. That period of readjustment and reformation must be regarded a complete. There are two directions in which the service can now go. The one is towards a learner, efficient, customer-focused service which deserves and gets fair remuneration and great job satisfaction. The other is to slide down the slippery slope of a bloated bureaucracy, underpaid, demotivated and caring nothing for its clients, whether ministers or members of the public. Our investigations have shown that the service has started down that slope. It must be pulled back before it is too late".

The Commission recommended *inter alia* that:

The present pay structure should be abolished and in its place a new structure based on job value and personal performance should be implemented. This unified structure will exclude the teaching and other unified services each of which would have a pay structure based on the same performance-oriented principle.

On conduct and discipline, the Commission recommended that the government adopt a set of principles for the operation of public services with "service to the Public" remaining the underlying principle. A code of conduct was to be drafted under the supervision of the Head of the Civil Service, and applied in the civil service. Training and capacity building for performance management were also identified as critical reform instruments.

Before the attainment of independence the majority of Namibians saw public service delivery as a favour from those in authority. After independence the colour of the faces serving behind counters and in public places changed, but poor work attitudes and bad public relations persisted. Queues became even longer and the public endured poor services. The wage and salary commission made strong recommendations on this score, linking the enhanced renumeration to improved customer service. Namibians have also become more aware of their rights as citizens in a democracy. The media, particularly, television and radio programmes, have done alot to encourage the people to speak out against poor services and to create awareness.

As far as the downsizing of the public service is concerned, the commission recommended that from 1996/97 onwards, there should be a continuing squeeze on the annual personnel budget, with a five-year programme of reduction of 2 per cent per annum. Half the cost of recommended pay increase was to come from the budget savings.

This recommendedation was based on the Zimbabwe experience where 17,000 posts have been abolished since 1990/91. The new Public Service Act (Act 13) of 1995 complements this report with a strict and shorter route to the enforcement of descipline, prohibition on remunerated work and on engagement in business by public servants. The Prime Minister, made it clear to Permament Secretaries at the beginning of 1996 that the Act would have to be strictly adhered to.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Balogun, M.J. "The Economy of Namibia: Prospects for a Sustainable Public Sector pay and employment policy" (A discussion paper prepared for the Wage and salary Commission), 1995

Jeremiah Melvyn, G., "Manpower and expenditure controls in the Public Service" Republic of Namibia (1992)

Office of the Prime Minister, " Re-organization and strengthening of the machinery of Government"

Office of the Prime Minister, Department of Public Service Management, "Proposals for downsizing the Public Service" (1992)

Public Service Commission, *Annual Report* 1 January - 13 December 1994.

Office of the Prime Minister, *Report of the Wage and Salary Commission*, Windhoek, November 1995.

CORE ELEMENTS OF CIVIL SERVICE REFORM: FOCUS ON TANZANIA

Deogratias A. Ntukamazina

Introduction

The primary objective of this paper is to discuss the experience of Tanzania in the design and implementation of a comprehensive civil service reform programme. Through this sharing of experience, it is anticipated that a contribution would have been made to our understanding of the core elements of civil service reform.

The Government of Tanzania has since the mid 1980s, been pursuing civil service reforms simultaneously with its economic restructuring programme. The global economic difficulties which were sparked of by the oil shocks of the 1970s deepened into an economic crisis for Tanzania in the 1980s. To combat the economic crisis, Tanzania had to undertake structural adjustment reforms. Unfortunately, the civil service which was supposed to initiate and spearhead the reforms to combat the economic crisis, was itself in a more serious crisis.

After the attainment of independence in 1961, the socio-political and economic philosophy as well as the policies that were pursued, radically redefined the role and functions of the government of the new Republic of Tanzania (United Republic of Tanzania in 1964 after the union with Zanzibar). This translated into extensive government involvement in all spheres of the country's economic and social life.

However, this enlarged role of government in economic and social activities was ultimately deemed inconsistent with sustainable economic growth, and with the efficient and effective delivery of public services. It should be noted that, in the 1970's and the first half of the 1980's, the country's productive capacity and infrastructure seriously deteriorated, and both the quantity and quality of government services declined to unacceptably low levels.

During this period of economic down-turn, recruitment into the civil service continued to expand, even though government was unable to pay competitive wages. Consequently, the morale, discipline and productivity of the civil servants were seriously eroded. This soon resulted in a severe weakening of institutional administrative capacity.

In brief, the problems that warranted a fundamental reform of the government and the civil service included:

- involvement of government in too many projects and functions;
- poor renumeration of government employees;
- erosion of discipline, and poor attitude to work;
- decline in ethical standards and increase in incidence of corruption;
- overstaffing;
- poor personnel records;
- low technical and managerial skills;
- obsolete administrative technologies;
- politicization of the civil service.

The Tanzania civil service reform programme was therefore initiated by the government to address the problems outlined above, and with a view to improving the efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of public services.

I. Civil Service Reform: the guiding principles

The government's fundamental goal in launching the civil service reform programme is to achieve a smaller, affordable, well compensated, efficient and effective civil service. In this context, the government seeks to redefine the role of the civil service, and to improve its skills and capacity so that these are relevant to, and consistent with, the national development strategy, and prompt delivery of public services.

Underpinning the civil service reform vision is the new objective of enhancing private sector role in the provision of economic and social services and correspondingly, reducing the role of government in direct economic production. Hence, it is assumed that this vision must be guided by the realization that the rigid bureaucracies which performed fairly well in the past, could not cope with the demands of a rapidly changing environment. These bureaucracies will have no place in the information-intensive and knowledge-

based 21st century. Rapid changes in technology call for flexibility. The present bureaucracies, if at all they make it to the 21st century, will be outdated. They will be like the luxury ocean liners in an age of supersonic jets--big, cumbersome and extremely difficult to turn around.

In realization of the need for change, the government evolved a set of principles which were to govern the design and implementation of civil service reform. These include the principles of:

- **competition** - service delivery was to be competitively administered;
- **community-ownership** - local communities would be empowered to manage basic services e.g community schools, health centres, and water supply schemes;
- **results-orientation** - the performance of agencies would be frequently assessed by focussing not only on inputs but on outcomes;
- **mission-orientation** - each agency of government was to be driven by its goals and mission, and not simply by rules and regulations;
- **customer-supremacy** - clients should be viewed as customers, and efforts should be made to meet the needs of the customer, not of the operators of the bureaucracy;
- **entrepreneurship** - no longer isolated from the market forces, the government bureaucracy would now be expected to take risks and pioneer innovation;
- **pre-emptive problem-solving** - the bureaucracy would also be expected to anticipate problems and work out solutions, and rely on prevention rather than on cure;
- **decentralization** - the central authority will not assume an omniscient posture, and will instead rely on regional and peripheral authorities to make inputs into the policy formulation, implementation, and review process;
- **market orientation** - it will subject allocative decisions to market tests instead of resolving problems by administrative fiat or decree;
- **partnership-building** - the civil service will steer rather than row, and will facilitate the involvement of other actors in the development process.

While pushing novel ideas on public service management, the government sought to preserve certain attributes of the conventional civil service. The concern for professionalism and political impartiality explains

the new emphasis placed by the government on the following measures:

- recruitment of civil servants on the basis of open and fair competition
- promotion of staff on the basis of merit;
- adequate renumeration of civil servants; and
- security of tenure for those civil servants with a record of integrity, discipline and high performance.

Further, the government embarked on a policy of decentralization. In particular, it restructured regional and local government administrations, and transferred additional functions to them.

II. Civil Service Reform Objectives

The ultimate and fundamental objective of the Tanzania civil service reform programme is to attain efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of goods and services to the people. In other words, the reform seeks to ensure that the civil service gives values for money. The specific objectives of the reform programme include:

- redefining the roles and functions of the government, reducing the scope of government operations to an affordable scale, and restructuring its organization and operations to achieve efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of public services;
- controlling the size and growth of government employment so that overstaffing is eliminated and the government is ultimately in a position to pay competitive wages rates;
- improving the quality, capacity, productivity and performance of the civil servants through strengthening the systems and procedures for personnel recruitment, deployment, grading and promotions, training and discipline;
- rationalizing and enhancing civil service pay by eliminating the distortions and anomalies that have crept into the system, and by improving total compensation at all levels so that it meets the minimum household living requirements and is commensurate with the qualifications, skills, experience and responsibilities of individual civil servants, and

- promoting the decentralization of government functions by rationalizing central and local government linkages, and facilitating further transfer of authority, responsibilities and resources to the districts.

III. Major Components of the Reform Programme

The Tanzania civil service reform programme was launched in July, 1991. The first two years were spent on studies which tried to identify obstacles to the effective performance of the civil service.

The programme started with a narrow and short term goal of downsizing and reducing the cost of government. This narrow vision led to the immediate retrenchment of redundant civil servants in 1992/93. In 1993 the government realized that the scope of the reform needed to be broadened. It therefore proceeded to develop a programme with a long-term orientation. The main elements of the new CSR programme are:

- organization and efficiency reviews
- personnel control and management
- pay reform
- capacity building
- rationalization of government employment
- local government reform
- redeployment
- Organizations and Efficiency (O&E) Review

The objective of this component of the programme is to redefine the roles and functions of government in order to hive-off functions not considered to be critical, to reduce the scope of government operations to an affordable scale, and to increase efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of public services. The organization and efficiency review is a lead component of the programme. Implementation of the other elements of the programme will very much depend on the results of the reviews.

To date, diagnostic reviews have been completed in central and sectoral ministries, including ministries involved in economic activities. Attention would subsequently shift to the remaining five ministries handling general administrative matters.

The organization and efficiency reviews have yielded significant results. In July, 1994, for instance, the government decided to transfer ten departments or functional areas to autonomous and self financing (executive) agencies. Besides, the government accepted a recommendation of the Organization and Efficiency Task Force to create an autonomous Revenue Authority out of the existing revenue collection departments.

Every ministry is required to form a ministerial reform committee (MRC) headed by the Principal Secretary/Permanent Secretary to steer the reforms in the ministry. The Ministry Reform Committees receive technical support from the Organization and Efficiency Task Force which is located within the CSRP Secretariat. The involvement of ministerial staff in actual implementation of the reforms has enhanced support for, and fostered rank and-file "ownership" of the programme. This is in fact the rationale behind the establishment of Technical Task Groups (TTGs) which implemented the reform at the ministerial level.

Pay Reform

Pay reform is a very critical element of the civil service reform programme in Tanzania. The civil servants' low levels of salaries and wages are known to have contributed greatly to the decline in morale, ethics, discipline and productivity. There are two immediate objectives of pay reform. The first is to work towards the realization of a minimum living wage, while the second seeks to streamline the pay structure by making it more transparent. However, an evolving and incremental pay reform spanning a three- to five year period, has been planned.

The primary goal is to enhance the salaries of civil servants, but a key first step in the reform process is to improve transparency and equity in the current renumeration system through the consolidation of non-incidental allowances into the basic salary. Allowances, which are currently untaxed, represent a substantial proportion of total renumeration both for some individuals and particular occupational groups. These have been introduced in a ad-hoc fashion in response to pressures from special interest groups. The outcome of the uneven clamour for allowances is the inequity in renumeration between and among different cadres of civil servants.

Government has already consolidated nearly one third of non-incidental allowances (in 1995) and plans to complete the consolidation of the remaining allowances in the 1997/98 financial year. The advantages of consolidation of allowances include:

(i) revealing the distortions in the pay structure, and enhancing transparency in the civil service remuneration process;
(ii) enhanced pension (resulting from the addition of allowances to net salary prior to the calculation of pension benefits).

However, the wage bill ceiling provided in the national budget frame severely limits progress towards the enhancement of civil service pay. Rapid progress in pay reform is indeed contingent upon a number of factors, among them, the rationalization and control of government employment, in the short- and medium term; rapid economic growth, with corresponding increase in government revenue; efficient tax policies and prompt collection of revenue; proper management of government resources and avoidance of unnecessary expenditures.

Personnel Control and Management Component

The objectives of the personnel control and management reform component include:

- instituting controls in the numbers and quality of personnel recruited into the civil service;
- consolidating the gains from efficiency reviews, budget rationalization and staff retrenchment;
- in the medium- to long-term, developing personnel management systems and practices as a basis for sustainable improvements in the capacity and performance of the civil service, and
- re-invigorating ethics, discipline and accountability in the civil service.

Between 1993 and 1996, the government successively instituted a number of important measures that resulted in stringent control on recruitment of personnel into the civil service. Specifically, in July 1992, the President promulgated measures which in effect froze all recruitment into the public service except in the priority sectors of education, health and internal security (police and prison). In November, 1994, the Chief Secretary, the Paymaster-

General and the Principal Secretary of the Civil Service Department jointly announced measures to enhance the effectiveness of policies on recruitment in both central and local government establishments. These measures included: (i) banning the recruitment of non professional/technical staff in the education, health and internal security establishments; (ii) banning automatic recruitment for replacements, and (iii) mandating the Central Establishment office to assume full control of recruitment into all central and local government establishments.

Further, in 1995, the government decided that, at least for the medium-term the current size of the civil service would be either maintained or reduced. In this regard, the government launched a comprehensive exercise of determining the number of employees paid outside the computerized payroll.

At the same time, the government began the implementation of a donor-assisted project on the installation of a personnel control and information system. it is planned that through the project: (i) a new payroll system at the Treasury would be installed, and (ii) a computerized personnel information system would also be introduced in ministries.

Another significant development is the completion of a comprehensive study on the 'Rationalization and Restructuring of Government Employment' which was undertaken by a team of national experts. The study inter alia sought to: (i) spell out the standards, controls and practices that should be instituted for ensuring the quality of those to be recruited and retained in the civil service; (ii) determine the opportunities, scope and strategy for reducing the overall size of the government; (iii) introduce measures to reinstate discipline in the service, including a draft code of conduct for civil servants; and (iv) identify a strategy for the professionalization of the civil service, including the definition of an appropriate institutional and legal framework for the civil service in a multi-party political system.

Capacity Building

This is another critical element of the Civil Service Reform Programme. The main thrust of the programme is to create capacity to ensure that the government could discharge efficiently those tasks which are retained in the public domain. Capacity building is going to be carried out in three areas:

(i) technical capacity building for civil servants who do not possess the requisite skills to perform their duties;
(ii) Managerial capacity building for those in leadership positions;
(iii) institutional capacity building.

Other areas of concern in capacity building include:

- enhancement of the capacity of women civil servants to occupy, and function effectively in leadership positions in the civil service;
- enhancing the ability of the government to attract, motivate, develop and retain staff;
- strengthening the consulting profession in Tanzania so that it can play an important role in capacity building and training.

The government has, over the past few years, assessed the capacity and performance of the civil service. However, the resources required to implement capacity building proposals have been limited. All the same, management development workshops were launched, beginning with one for Principal Secretaries and Regional Development Directors in 1995. A comprehensive capacity building programme is also being developed for co-financing by a number of donors.

Retrenchment and Rationalization of Government Employment

As already stated above, the initial focus of the civil reform programme was on the retrenchment of surplus employees. Between in 1992/93 and 1995, about 51, 101 employees were laid off for various reasons (See Table 1).

Number of Government Employees taken off the Payroll, 1995, (by Criterion applied)	Number
Criteria Applied	
1. Poor Performance (including alcoholics and the grossly undisciplined	4,537
2. Retired from hived-off functions (including the Medical Supplies Department)	4,714
3. "Ghost" workers from National Pay Day, February, 1994	14,700
4. Last In First Out (LIFO) in overstaffed establishment	8,169
5. Least qualified in overstaffed agencies (mainly in local authorities	14,823
6. Volunteers for early retirement	5,159
Total	**51,101**

Source: Civil Service Reform Secretarial, Office of the President, Tanzania.

Future retrenchment is to be carried out taking into account (i) the results of Organization and Effective studies which indicate prospects for a further decrease of up to 10,000 employees over the short- to medium-term, (ii) the launching of a voluntary early retirement scheme. Some donors have indicated interest in supporting the financing of retrenchment and voluntary early retirement in specifically targeted (non-critical skills) cadres of the civil service. Therefore, the CSRP is currently working on the design of an early retirement scheme (both voluntary and mandatory) within a framework of a multi-donor funded programme.

Redeployment

Following the first wave of retrenchment in 1992, the cabinet directed that further retrenchments should be done with a human face. This requires putting in place safety-nets to assist retrenched employees to transit from government employment to self-or alternative employment.

The secretariat of the Civil Service Reform Programme has strived to operate within these guidelines. The redeployment sub-programme has two distinct components, viz:

- enterprise development and training and
- counselling, training and information package sub-component.

Enterprise Development

This has a number of features. The first phase of the programme was started in October 1994 and completed in March 1995. A total of 295 potential entrepreneurs received training at 10 workshops on entrepreneurship development. The Eastern and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI) was commissioned to facilitate this. The second phase of the programme started in May, 1995 and completed in October, 1995. A total of 10 training workshops on entrepreneurship Development and Venture Management were again conducted in ten centres of the country, each centre bringing together two regions. About 500 retrenched civil servants participated in the programme.

In order to reach a greater number of those in need of re-deployment, a Training of Trainers (TOT) workshop was planned, starting April 1996 and involving 24 trainers from selected training institutions. After the TOT, the trainers will simultaneously conduct workshops in various parts of the country on the basis of the demand for entrepreneurship training from the retrenched civil servants. It is expected that 5,000 will be trained during 1996.

The Counselling, Training and Information Component

With support from the World Bank (IDA) the Government of Tanzania embarked on a counselling, training and information programme aimed at assisting retrenched officials to prepare for productive life, especially self-employment, outside the civil service. The scheme entails, among other things, providing counselling services for an estimated 32,000 laid-of government employees. For this role, a total of 162 redeployment counsellors, working under 17 counselling organizations were trained. There are 61 counselling centres in various parts of the country. Counselling is provided on the presentation of vouchers to the counsellors. Every eligible person gets a set of five vouchers, each having a face value of Tshs.500 (or US$1).

In addition, skills training services, are to be provided by numerous approved training institutions that have branches in all districts of the Tanzania mainland. The training institutions were duly evaluated and accredited for the purpose of integrating them into the counselling system.

A special training seminar was also conducted in December, 1994 for all the 104 District Community Development Officers (who are the Voucher issuing Officers), and all Regional Community Development Officers and Regional Labour Officers who are to monitor voucher distribution and implementation in all the 20 regions. The training was also provided to representatives of various mass media institutions and relevant government ministries..

The redeployment programme is being regularly monitored by the CSRP secretariat to assess its impact and effectiveness.

Local Government Reform

When the civil service reform programme was redesigned in April, 1993, local government reforms did not feature as one of the elements. it was added after it was realized that reform in the central government must go had in hand with those of local government. This was important also because local government faced unique and more serious problems than did the central government. Examples are the problems of skills shortage, and of finance.

The objectives of the local government reform component are to:

- enhance the capacity of local government to provide basic services to the people, to mobilize local resources, and to promote self-reliant development;
- reallocated responsibilities and functions between central and local government (and between various levels of local authorities) by rationalizing central and local government linkages, and by facilitating further transfer of authority, responsibilities and resources to various levels of local authorities;
- transform local government into a dependable partner to central government in the system of governance and in providing the enabling environment required by various development actors;

- ensure that councilors and other leaders at the grassroots level as well as staff working with local authorities do have full knowledge of their duties and responsibilities, and that each category appreciates the limits of its authority, knowing fully well the need to uphold the law as well as rules and regulations;
- have in place a local government system supported by adequate resources including manpower, finance, and equipment so that it can properly discharge its duties.

In pursuance of the preceding objective, a draft project, focusing on the essential elements in local government reform has been prepared. The proposal outlines the need for the declination of functions and responsibilities between central and local government, strengthening of various levels of local authorities, and putting in place appropriate linkages between and among levels of government.

The project also aims at reviewing the local government act and related legislation, central-local relations, staff-councillor relations, and at strengthening institutions which directly impact on the local government system i.e. the ministry responsible for local government, the Local Government Service Commission, the Local Government Service Commission, the Local Authorities Provident Fund, the Local Government Loans Board and the Association of Local Authorities in Tanzania. The training of local political leaders, the staff of local authorities, and the general public will be accorded high priority. The restructuring of the planning and budgeting system also constitutes basic elements of the local government reform programme.

To promote the "ownership" of the reform within the local authorities, efforts have been made to educate political leaders and chief executive of local authorities on what the reform programme entailed. This began with a briefing at the annual congress of the Association of the Local Authorities in Tanzania (ALAT) in December, 1995.

REPORT OF THE SEVENTEENTH ROUNDTABLE OF THE AFRICAN ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT

A.D. Yahaya
M.J. Balogun

Opening

The 17th AAPAM Roundtable Conference was opened on Saturday, March 2, 1996 at the Training Centre for Executives Cairo, by Dr. Atef M. Ebeid, the Minister of Administrative Development and Environment Affairs. The Conference focussed on the theme "Civil Service Reform in Africa: Past Experiences and Future Trends". The Roundtable Conference was attended by delegates from African countries and a number of International Organizations.

In a brief statement at the opening ceremony, Mr Essam El Nagger, President of the Central Agency for Organization and Administration (C.A.O.A.) which co sponsored the Conference, welcomed delegates and emphasized the importance and timeliness of the conference theme. According to him, He expressed the hope that delegates would compare notes and exchange experiences on different aspects of the reform process in their countries.

In his own statement, the President of AAPAM, Mr. William N, Wamalwa, thanked the President of the Arab Republic of Egypt, H.E. Mr. Mohamed Hosni Mubarak, the Government and the people of the Arab Republic of Egypt, for hosting the 17th Roundtable Conference and for the hospitality extended to AAPAM and the delegates. He also thanked the Honorable Minister, Dr. Atef Mohammed Ebeid for personally coming to declare are Roundtable Conference open. He remarked that although this was the first Roundtable Conference to be held in the Arab Republic of Egypt, it was not the first time AAPAM was being hosted by Egypt. He recalled a number of AAPAM senior policy seminars hosted by Egypt since 1966.

Speaking on the theme of the Roundtable Conference, Mr. Wamalwa noted that one might legitimately ask why the subject of Civil Service Reform in Africa was deemed relevant. He said since its inception over thirty years age, AAPAM had expended considerable effort, time and resources seeking ways and means to encourage reform and to stimulate changes in the practice of public administration and management. This was with a view to improving organizational structures, institutional arrangements, personnel management, planning techniques, and training policy.

Mr. Wamalwa further remarked that in subsequent years, the civil service reform agenda in Africa expanded to include the inauguration of comprehensive programmes of public service restructuring and strengthening. He noted that the terms of reference of the review commissions established in the 1970s revealed a comprehensive perspective to reform, the goal being the enhancement of the performance of the public service as whole (i.e. the civil service, public enterprises, local government and decentralized agencies, and in some cases, educational institutions, law enforcement agencies and the judiciary). Mr. wamalwa stated that despite earlier efforts at administrative and civil service reform, it was evident that by the 1980s the civil service remained grossly inadequate in confronting the challenges of development management and democratic governance in Africa. Thus, the civil service in all African states expanded in size considerably at an annual rate of 5 - 15 per cent from mid-1970s. Furthermore, the role of the service has expanded beyond its human and institutional capacity. For example, the public service was called upon to engage in commercial and service-delivery functions for which it has no capacity. in order to fulfil the roles expected of the modern civil service, Mr. Wamalwa stated that radical reform of the institution was necessary.

He submitted that the African civil service of the future should be re-engineered to ensure that it operated with high level of skills, high ethical standards, and impeccable conduct. he emphasized that the processes to create such a civil service should involve inter alia the following actions:

(a) restructuring the civil service and re defining its functions;
(b) promoting and defending the democratic process;
(c) inculcating a customer-service orientation in the civil service;
(d) encouraging decentralization;
(e) adopting total quality management for enhanced performance; and

(f) forming a partnership with all sectors of civil society to address issues of growth and distributive justice.

In a vote of thanks, the Deputy President of AAPAM, Dr. James Nti paid glowing tribute to the President, Government and People of the Arab Republic of Egypt for hosting the 17th AAPAM Roundtable Conference in Cairo. he also recalled the past contributions of Egypt to the achievement of AAPAM objectives. he acknowledged, in particular, the contributions made to AAPAM in its formative years by eminent Egyptians, among them, the late Dr Fouad Sheriff. He thanked Governments and sponsoring institutions for releasing top functionaries to attend the conference. Dr. Nti also acknowledged the contribution of donor agencies whose assistance was vital to the success of the conference.

The keynote address was presented by the Honorable Minister of Public Enterprises Sector and Minister of State for Administrative Development and Environment, Dr. Atef Ebeid.

In the address, the honorable Minister thanked the President of the Arab Republic of Egypt, H,E. Mohammed Hosni Mubarak for agreeing to host the Roundtable Conference. He also welcomed participants to the African/Arab city of Cairo and expressed delight that the conference was holding in the ancient Egyptian capital.

The Minister noted that the Conference was timely as the subject of administrative reform was crucial to the socio-economic development of African states. He stated that the Arab Republic of Egypt would share with delegates the experience so far gained in the area of administrative reform, as well as learn from other countries.

He further stated that the Arab Republic of Egypt has gone through different phases of administrative reform and had recorded notable achievements. The Minister enumerated three phases of the reform. Under the first phase (covering the period 1982-1987), the country modernized her infrastructure, paying particular attention to the development of airports, sea-ports, rail-roads, electricity, the health and education sectors. Legislations were also reviews and revised, and private sector participation in the above mentioned areas was encouraged.

Within the second phase (1987-1991), the Government implemented financial and monetary reforms, and revised legislations to that effect. The objective here was to achieve balance of payment stability and establish parity in relation to the world's major currencies. The reform during this period removed difficulties in banking operations and introduced appropriate enabling legislations.

Under the third phase (1991- to date), the country has sought to reform the economic structure and remove the remaining impediments to private sector participation in economic activities. Under the present arrangement, participation in economic activities of the country is open to all nationalities and there are basically no restrictions other that in military areas. That implies that foreigners and citizens are free to invest in agriculture, education, roads, and the industrial sector. however, the Government seeks to strike a balance between the needs and interests of foreign investors and those of citizens. This is reflected in government subsidy in such areas as bread and sugar.

This phase also aims at liberalizing exports and imports, establishing economic self-sufficiency, and protecting the poor against the economic effects of reforms. Training for vocational jobs and disbursement of funds for trade and other productive ventures are also being undertaken.

In order to achieve the overall objectives of the reforms the Minister suggested that a comprehensive programme be drawn up containing the main thrusts of those reforms. He emphasized the need to motivate those involved in the implementation of the reforms through equitable methods of recruitment, training, promotion based on merit and performance-related remuneration. The Minister noted the important role which information plays in the achievement of the stated objectives, and said that it was for that reason that the country established an information data bank in 1995 to ensure and streamline the flow of information necessary for administrative reforms. The country has now embarked on what the Minister described as "Total legislative Reforms" which aims to describe and define what services are to be provided by the state and to remove the remaining restrictions on private sector participation in economic activities.

The Minister expressed the hope that the Roundtable Conference would come up with far-reaching recommendations which would enhance the performance of the civil service.

Plenary Session I: Content and Core Elements of CSR

The first plenary session featured two presentations. The first by Dr. Robert Dodoo, is titled "Civil Service Reform in Africa: Past Experience and Future Trends". The second presentation was by Mr. Deogratias A. Ntukamazina under the title "Core Elements of the Tanzania Civil Service Reform: An assessment of Relevance and Impact".

Dr. Robert Dodoo's paper begins with a discussion of the crucial role of the African public services. Against the backdrop of the poor socio economic conditions prevailing in many African states and the low level of productivity, African leaders were, according to him, obliged to implement stringent structural adjustment programmes (SAPs). In Ghana, the government took the initiative in drawing up Vision 2000 spelling out strategies for accelerating economic growth and meeting the challenges of the 21st century.

Dr. Dodoo addressed reasons for the decline in the performance of African public services shortly after independence. Among these are the rapid proliferation of institutions and increase in personnel, inefficient and unproductive allocation of resources, excessive bureaucratization and red-tapism, as well as corruption. Others include political instability, inadequate financial resources, and lack of training and retraining opportunities.

Dr. Dodoo noted that the earlier phase of civil service reform in Ghana had limited impact due to factors such as the failure of the civil servants to define, internalize, and "own" the context and direction of reform, and, accordingly, the persistence of the old management culture in spite of the new emphasis on results and productivity.

Dr. Dodoo highlighted the new approach to civil service reform in Ghana. Tagged as the Public Sector National Institutional Renewal Programme (NIRP), its major component is the Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP). In the view of Dr. Dodoo, the new programme aims among other things at economic growth and development, quality in service delivery, efficiency, cost effectiveness, and good governance. According to him, NIRP's objectives were consistent with the strategic orientation of Vision 2000.

In his own contribution, Mr. Ntukamazina gave a detailed account of reform efforts in Tanzania and highlighted the problems encountered in defining

the content and core elements of civil service reform. He paid particular attention to the various institutional reforms undertaken before the recent shifts to macro economic (especially, privatization and public enterprise) reform. He also described the dilemma facing the government in the area of decentralization as well as the problematic issues of deconcentration and devolution.

Participants' Comments

Following the two presentations, the participants made the following observations:

(i) while uniformity appears as a common feature of CRS in Africa, it is necessary to take into account the conditions prevailing in each country;

(ii) the problem of overstaffing should be tackled without jeopardizing the credibility and integrity of the civil service;

(iii) there is need to complement external donor inputs into the reform process with internal material and intellectual contributions;

(iv) an institutional mechanism should be devised making it possible for African civil services to exchange information on the design, implementation, and impact of reforms;

(v) civil service retrenchment should not be carried out unless and until proper manpower audits have been undertaken, and in any case, the transparency of the entire process should be beyond question;

(vi) a consensus on the definition of "civil servants" should precede any action leading to the formulation of policy on the "optimum size" of the civil service;

(vii) the training institutions which are supposed to play a major role in civil service reform are themselves in need of redynamization.

Plenary session II: Pay and Employment Reform

The second plenary session featured two main presentations. The first, by Dr. M.J. Balogun is based on a background document submitted to the Wage and Salary Commission of Namibia, and focuses on perspectives in pay and employment policy reform. The second presentation was made by Dr. Farouk Helmy under the title "The Management of Government Organization in Egypt within the context of Contemporary Changes."

Dr. Balogun's paper begins with a conceptual framework tracing the relationship between pay and employment policy, on the one hand, and political, macro-economic, labour-market, and managerial factors, on the other. The paper then proceeds to examine pay and employment levels in Namibia within the context of the country's economic growth prospects. It outlines various measures aimed at achieving the objectives of a sustainable pay and employment policy not only in Namibia but also in other African countries.

Dr. Balogun's paper raises the questions whether the focus should be on short-term considerations such as pay and employment reform, or on the long-term issue of performance and productivity management. After exploring the conflicting perspectives on pay and employment - particularly, the economically-rational viewpoint stressing staff retrenchment, down-sizing, and payment of "competitive" wage, as against the politically-rational model which emphasized the "social responsibility" and employment creation task of government - the paper sees the sustainability of reform as lying in the design and implementation of a long-term and comprehensive programme of productivity and performance management, human and institutional capacity, attitude modification, and procedure rationalization.

Dr. Farouk Helmy's paper examines the management of government organizations in Egypt within the context of the contemporary changes. The paper identifies the key challenges which face the Egyptian government organizations and the main requirements to address these challenges. It also identifies the major dimensions of the strategies and plans which have been formulated by the Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA), the central civil service body responsible for conducting and monitoring the process of administrative development in the government sector.

Dr. Helmy sees these challenges as "national" and "international". They include shifting from a national economy to a global system, formulating free market and privatization policies, moving from low to high technology, and achieving high levels of social and economic welfare for all citizens.

Dr. Helmy proceeds to suggest the essential prerequisites for meeting the challenges, i.e., strategic planning for identifying and drawing up long term objectives, adopting efficient policies for directing and rationalizing the process of decision making, systems and procedures for following up and implementation.

Dr. Helmy further spells out the roles of three organs responsible for administrative reform and development. These are the State Ministry for Administrative Development, the Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA) and the Organization and Management Units which are established in various ministries, governorates and other public organs.

In this context, the CAOA assists in adjusting and developing the organization structures of governmental organizations, rationalizing job structures and promoting optimum utilization of manpower, ensuring justice and equal treatment, establishing an efficient data-base to support the decision-making process in governmental units, enhancing the efficiency of the employees by giving highest consideration to training, procedures simplification, and the establishment of one-stop centres to expedite service delivery.

Participants' Comments

The participants' commented on the two presentation as follows:

(i) the emphasis on the long-haul - i.e., on the design and implementation of a long term performance improvement programme - should replace the existing haphazard, and retro-active approach to civil service reform,

(ii) While lethargy and laxity in civil service performance need to be met with occasional "shock treatments", tinkering with pay and employment levels will not necessarily guarantee productivity or lead to instant savings in costs;

(iii) job evaluation is a vital instrument for aligning pay with productivity, or, at least, ensuring equal pay for substantially equal work;

(iv) a performance-related pay structure which integrates the various allowances and perquisites with the basic remuneration will not only ensure transparency in public salary administration but assist in streamlining pay, employment, and performance management decisions;

(v) administrative reform is a continuous process, and not a once-for-all 'quick fix';

(vi) even when "formal" civil service reform processes have been completed, managers and administrators have a major role to play in implementing, following-up, and re-designing systems and procedures;

(vii) the basic infrastructure for the management of change should be provided before time and resources are invested in sophisticated techniques and technologies.

Plenary Session III: Nature and Scope of Competencies in Civil Service Reform

Two papers were presented at the third plenary session./ The first paper by Dr. James Nti is titled "Nature, Scope of New Competencies in Civil Service Reform." The second presentation was made by Mrs. M.F. Cupido and is titled "Nature and Scope of New Competencies in Civil Service Reform with Particular Reference to the Namibian Experience".

In the conceptual part of Dr. Nti's paper, major problems relating to the definition of 'administrative reform', 'civil service reform' as well as the difference between 'administrative change' and 'administrative reform' are highlighted. Dr. Nti defines 'reform' as a "systematic process of introducing changes with the objective of improving management practices, eliminating or at least minimizing the dysfunctions in the structures and processes of an existing administrative system to make it more efficient and effective in attaining its objectives and sustaining such gains."

From the nature of civil service reform, Dr. Nti highlights two points, namely, the dynamic and unending nature of civil service reforms, as well as the variety of these reforms, as clearly illustrated by Africa's experience. Dr. Nti categorizes administrative reform efforts in Africa into three. According to him, the first generation of reforms focussed on the needs and demands of sovereignty, and as such, could be regarded as politically motivated.

The second phase of reforms resulted from the work of high- powered Civil Service Review Commissions appointed by governments in the late 60s and early 70s. They were triggered by socio-economic, ideological, and historical factors.

The third phase began in the 1980's as a result of the conditionalities imposed by the Bresson Woods institutions as part of structural adjustment loans and structural adjustment programmes (SAPs).

Even where the objectives of reforms were the same, the approach and strategy adopted varied from one country to another. Besides, CSR does not necessarily have to be comprehensive and government-wide. It could be partial in terms of the issues addressed or the institutions subjected to critical review.

Dr. Nti further notes that the major feature of successful cases reform is the general acceptance of the fact that reform is likely to be sustainable if leaders decide in advance where they want to go, and what steps they need to take - and in what order - to get there. It involves having a vision, formulating the grand goals in consultation with key stakeholders, and plotting and sequencing the necessary steps. The chances of such reform programmes succeeding are enhanced it they are formulated locally, albeit, with external assistance.

On the critical skills required for civil service reform, Dr. Nti suggests policy analytic, strategic planning, data collection and dissemination, management information, human resource management, financial and accounting, and change management skills. These are lacking in much of the African public services, but could be provided through institutional and human capacity building programmes.

In conclusion, Dr. Nti argues that reforms are more likely to succeed if the nature and scope of the reforms, and particularly, the strategy for implementing those reforms, fully reflect the peculiar conditions and circumstances of the country concerned and the availability of the resources needed.

The second paper was presented by Mrs. Cupido and focussed on the Namibian experience. In her paper, Mrs. Cupido describes the creation of a colonial civil service in Namibia between 1964 and 1980 which was paternalistic, racial, corrupt and riddled with nepotism.

The period between 1980 and 1990 was that of 'interim government' during which South Africa, in the process of disengagement, attempted to use the civil service to perpetuate racial and tribal divisions by creating a central administration for the whites and ethically defined, second-tier administrations for the black majority.

Independence in 1991 therefore found Namibia with a public service lacking in a national orientation. The incoming government found a plethora of administrations adhering to the ideology of apartheid. The government had to reconstitute the colonial bureaucracy and the second-tier administrations into a unified Public Service of Namibia. Inevitably the public service became bloated. Hence, the need for the reforms of 1992 entailing the rationalization of the public service.

Although a lot has been achieved, some problems remain, including how to relate to militant unions in the service.

Participants' Comments

The participants commented on the two presentations as follows:

(i) political commitment is essential to the successful implementation of civil service reform;
(ii) while external assistance is indispensable to the inauguration of civil service reform, the sustainability of reform measures hinges on internal leadership in the design, implementation, and monitoring of reform programmes;
(iii) the issue of down-sizing should be re examined taking into account the economic and social problems facing African States.

Plenary Session IV: Measuring Impact and Results of CSR

The fourth plenary session was devoted to a comparative assessment of civil service reforms and lessons for the future. Three papers were presented and discussed.

The first paper titled "Comparative Assessment of the Impact and Results of Civil Service Reform" was presented by Mr. Abulsalam El-Gibaly on behalf of himself and a team of researchers from the Egyptian Central Agency for Organization and Administration (CAOA).

Mr. El-Gibaly began with an introduction in which he sought to define development as perceived in Egypt in the early 1950s. He then proceeded to explain the role played by the Civil Service in the development process as well as the need for government involvement in the production of goods and

services. Over the years, however, the complexities of managing a state, and the rising expectations of an ever-increasing population exposed the weaknesses of the bureaucracy, and pointed to the need for reforms.

The Egyptian government thus embarked on reforms whose major thrust was to promote private sector development and divest government of its erstwhile responsibilities. As part of these reforms, the government took the following measures:

(a) reducing the number of legislations and merging complementary legislations;
(b) delivering efficient services;
(c) establishing on-stop centres for service-delivery and to enhance efficiency and effectiveness generally;
(d) simplifying rules and procedures for service delivery;
(e) maintaining a balance between contributions from the public and the private sectors as well as protecting the society's interests;
(f) allowing for flexibility in solutions to problems instead of rigidly applying rules to every minute problem;
(g) encouraging and strengthening democracy and popular participation by all parties in the preparation of legislations while delegating authority for eventual implementation of such legislations to local authorities.

He concluded that, on the whole, Egypt's administrative reform have contributed considerably to a growing awareness of the need for reforms in terms of:

(a) organization
(b) development of services and
(c) rationalization of use of resources.

The second presentation was made by Dr. Jacques Bourgaudt, Professor of Public Administration, Department of Political Science at the University of Quebec, Canada. He spoke on the "Modernization of the Canadian Public Administration System".

He began by cautioning that the Canadian experience in civil service reform might not have direct lessons for other countries. He pointed out that

the reforms had been on for some 30 years. In the process, adequate conceptual distinctions have been established between public administration and public management.

Various roles have had to be assigned to the different levels of government along the principles of subsidiarity aiming at deregulation and the effective provision of services. This scheme requires results oriented strategies in which the relatively "minor" roles of politicians are to be well-articulated and distinguished from those of public/civil servants who have to be held accountable for implementation activities. In this process, one would have to look for opportunities to strike a balance between increasing openness in government and bureaucratic rigidity.

Mr. Clay Wescott, made the third presentation based on a paper titled "Civil Service Reform: lessons from Africa". He explained that his contribution was drawn from the experience of a multilateral group which includes the United Kingdom, Netherlands, France, Sweden, Norway, Denmark, ADB, Germany, World Bank and EEC, with the UNDP playing a coordinating role. The Working Group on Civil Service Reforms is, itself, part of a larger one overseeing the implementation of structural adjustment programmes in developing countries.

Mr. Westcott stated that the objectives of the Group are basically two, namely, to draw lessons from the various experiences and to design guidelines to improve donor support to civil service reforms in Africa. This was based on the assumption that some of the poor results from previous reform efforts had been caused by inappropriate advice from donors.

Mr. Wescott explained that the process spanned about a year and consisted of meetings held to assess field reports. Six (6) African countries had been selected for studies on the basis of the readiness of their governments to participate in the programme viz: Benin, Burkina Faso, Central African Republic, Ghana, Tanzania and Uganda.

As outputs, six country studies were to be produced along with guidelines for civil service reform based on the six studies. The guidelines in hand address an overall approach, programme design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, and donor assistance.

On the overall approach, attention is paid to purpose and scope of the reforms to achieve improved effectiveness, raise quality of work and feasibility, rather than affordability, of the reforms.

Mr. Wescott drew attention to the need for high-level leadership commitment, and for swift use of windows of reform opportunities. At all times, governments must take the lead in reform undertakings and invite donor assistance. In that spirit, both parties must aim to facilitate each other's activities and work towards well-articulated vision and strategies known to each other. Sequencing and timing of reform activities are, in this sense, very important.

He stressed the need for donors to accept that reforms normally take a long time to bear fruit, possibly up to twenty years. He went on to draw attention to the need to strengthen some core functions in the civil service as part of reforms, e.g., ministerial restructuring, decentralization, pay, incentives and capacity building. He advised that it is important to attempt giving civil servants assurances of minimum levels of remuneration.

Finally, he recommended that policy dialogue be initiated between governments and donors to ensure that conditionalities are determined by mutual agreement, along with some projections for the next steps that are required as a consequence of, or after, the implementation of the reforms.

Participants' Comments

The three presentations elicited the following observations:

(i) political support is essential to the success of civil service reform;
(ii) measures designed to simplify procedures and improve service-delivery systems should be accorded high priority in civil service reform;
(iii) "downsizing" may not necessarily lead to economies and, under certain conditions, may in fact prove costly;
(iv) The "status quo" elements in the public service will not pass up any opportunity to block substantive change;
(v) African governments and external donors should take steps to meet their obligations in the area of civil service reform;
(vi) the communication gap between those who stand to gain from, and those who lose as a result of, civil service reform should be constantly bridged;

(vii) while civil service reform goes beyond macro-economic reform, the two should be seen as mutually reinforcing rather than mutually antagonistic;
(viii) in building a strategic coalition for civil service reform, adequate attention should be paid to the potential contributions of members of the executive and the legislative branches of government, opinion leaders, interest groups, professional associations, and other stake holders; and
(ix) local resource persons should play the central, leadership role in the design and implementation of civil service reform, with external consultants bringing in valuable skills, comparative experience, and, if possible, resources.

Plenary Session V: Customer-Service Orientation in CSR

Three papers were presented at the fifth plenary session. The first paper was presented by Ms. Genevieve Enid Kyarimpa. Accounting to her, the content and direction of civil service reform in Uganda had been greatly influenced by the implementation of the structural adjustment programme. It was only in recent years that attention shifted to customer relations, and the introduction of changes designed to improve service-delivery mechanisms. The main features of the new customer-orientation are:

(i) decentralization, which has led to client-responsiveness and improved communication between the providers and the consumers of public services;
(ii) accountability, particularly with the adoption of the 're-call' principle in Uganda;
(iii) application of results-oriented management techniques;
(iv) emphasis on institutional and human capacity building;
(v) establishment of watch-dog institutions.

Ms. Kyarimpa concluded by hoping that comparative studies would be undertaken to provide guidance for future reforms.

The second paper was presented by Mr. Nabil Tawfik Hassan, the Head of Sector for Developing Government Services at the CAOA. He spoke on the "Design, Implementation and Evaluation of Civil Service Reform: A Perspective on Customer Service or Citizen Charter".

He noted that there was a long history of governmental reform in Egypt going back to 1952. In all, five stages may be discerned in the reform effort, during which various aspects of government business and processes were analyzed. Several regulations have also been issued to improve the service delivery capacity of government. As is to be expected, a lot of money had been spent on the exercise. In term of results, gains have been identified, including decentralization, improved work methods, establishment of integrated information system, and publication of procedures manuals. However, there have also been negative results. For instance, there has been an imbalance in the allocation of resources, and inadequate allocation for installation and maintenance of systems and procedures.

It is recommended that research be undertaken to support reform. Seminars should also be organized to inform the public. In pricing public services, the actual cost must be used to reduce the burden on the state budget. As much as possible, government services must be privatized. However, adequate safeguards must be provided to protect the interest of society and of public employees.

The last paper to be presented was that of Nana Amma Yeboaa. She noted that the "customer" of civil servants during the colonial period differs from that in the post-independence period. Unlike the past, satisfying the citizen as a customer is the raison d'etre of the existence of the civil service in an independent country. This consideration ought to guide reform effort.

Thus there is the need for a change of "hearts and minds". Nevertheless, efforts at reforms have continued to serve bureaucratic interests by and large, rather than improve the capacity to deliver quality service to citizens. There is still too much adherence to rules, and complex systems and procedures continue to impede service delivery. Attitudinal and cultural change must therefore be a fundamental prerequisite for successful reform.

The critical issues in designing customer focused reforms should include the following:

(i) diagnostic and stock-taking process that allows a comparison of inputs with outputs;
(ii) clear commitment to change the top leadership;
(iii) "clear-cut objectives consistent with institutional goals;

(iv) reconciliation of the priorities of service providers with the demands of the recipients;
(v) anticipation (at the planning change) of road-blocks to genuine reform; and
(vi) periodic review of performance against tangible indicators.

Participants' Comments

After the three presentations, the participants made the following comments:

(i) the public sector should adopt certain private sector concepts and practices in support of its new customer-orientation and service delivery programmes;
(ii) the level of public sector remuneration should be raised to attract and retain high calibre personnel;
(iii) in addition to procedure simplification aimed at enhancing the service-delivery capacity of the public service, a programme of civic education should be instituted sensitizing members of the public to their rights as recipients of public services;
(iv) the design of organization structures should reflect the inter-dependent relationship between service producers and consumers, provide regular feedback between the two, and facilitate instant rectification of faults and redress of grievances;
(v) a code of conduct should be an integral part of reforms designed to improve relations with customers; and

(vi) attitude change or behaviour modification should be accorded high priority in customer-oriented reform programmes.

Plenary Session VI: Decentralization Reform

Only one paper (by Prof. Fadlalla Ali Fadlalla) was presented at the sixth plenary session. The author examined decentralization reforms in the Sudan with special focus on community participation in development.

The paper notes how superimposed bureaucratic structures and their parallel political institutions accelerate or impede community participation in development. The history of community participation in the Sudan is also

provided. The Tabaldi village society (with its emphasis on free debate, freedom of choice, and equal share in outcomes) illustrates the system through which community participation was realized in the traditional society. Communal goals were set and means to implement them sought. Everybody gave according to his ability and took according to his needs.

With the Islamisation of the Sudan, the Tabaldi's populist forum was transformed into the village bureaucracy. The arrival of the British colonialists worsened the situation. The policies of direct and indirect rule created an elite class whose actions were at variance with the needs and aspirations of the local communities.

The Local Government Law of 1951 aimed at rejuvenating the old traditional Talbaldi system. With the fight for independence, legitimate role was sought for the system.

After independence, the 1971 people's Local Government Reform was enacted by the Nimeiry military regime. The Reform liquidated tribal and communal authority regained after 1951. This reform alienated the masses for the simple reason that it undermined genuine community participation.

Other issues discussed in the paper are those of federalism and the conflicting positions taken on it by the North and the South, the impact of military coups on community participation, and prospects for the establishment of a local government system that is genuinely representative of the people's will, and that is accountable, service-oriented, and responsive.

Participants' Comments

The participants focussed on measures aimed at entrenching democracy and strengthening democratic processes and institutions in Africa. Local government and decentralization were targeted as the principal means of achieving the objective.

Plenary Session VII: Public enterprise Reform and Privatization

The seventh plenary Session featured three papers. The first by Prof. Gatian F. Lungu, is titled "Public Service Reforms in Africa: Lessons from Experience". The second presentation was by Dr. Shamsudden Usman and

titled "Public Enterprise Reform in Nigeria", while the third one was by Dr. Atef Ebeid and titled "Public Enterprises Reform in Egypt".

In his paper, Prof. Lungu notes that despite the high expectations preceding the creation of PEs in post-independent Africa, their performance has consistently remained poor, hence the need for reforms. He added that disenchantment with PEs as under achievers came not only from governments but also from international financial institutions, such as the World Bank and the IMF. The thrusts of the reforms, the paper argues, were towards increasing efficiency, reducing the "twin" burdens of fiscal deficits and external debt, and stimulating competition in the economy by reducing the monopoly powers of some public enterprises.

On the impact of the reforms so far, the paper notes that the process had been slow and that the overall impact of various measures to revitalize African economies under the reforms remained to be seen.

The paper further observes that public enterprise reform in Africa has set in motion several developments aimed at revitalizing African economies, though initial results pointed towards losses, social dislocations, and the under-development of the private sector.

The second paper by Dr. Shamsudeen Usman is based on the author's experience as a main actor in the public enterprise reform process in Nigeria. The paper begins by examining the antecedents to public enterprise reform in Nigeria. It notes that the original objectives of setting up public enterprises in Nigeria were generally sound; and that up to mid-1970's most of the enterprises achieved operational efficiency and financial viability, in addition to providing high quality services.

However, by the late 1970s, the public enterprises started to encounter problems, as a result of the following factors, among others:

- poor recruitment practices;
- inadequate training;
- poor record keeping;
- declining productivity;
- excessive bureaucratization;

- lack of strategic planning; and
- political interference.

The paper argues that these and other factors led to the need to reform the public enterprises so as to achieve efficiency and increase productivity.

On the scope and coverage of Nigeria's public enterprise reform programme, the paper states that privatization was made an integral part of Nigeria's home-grown Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP). A Technical Committee on Privatization and Commercialization (TCPC) was set up in 1988 to oversee and implement the Government's policy on privatization and commercialization. The paper further notes that in Nigeria, there were four categories of privatized enterprises, namely, those ear-marked for:

(a) full privatization;
(b) partial privatization;
(c) full commercialization; and
(d) partial commercialization

Five methods of privatization were adopted, viz: Public Offer of Shares through the Nigerian Stock Exchange; Private Placement; sale of assets of enterprises judged to be unviable; Management Buy Out and Deferred Public Offer.

The paper finally assesses Nigeria's success with public enterprise reform and notes, that so far, much had been achieved, although there was still room for improvement, especially in the area of commercialization.

The third paper was presented by Dr. Atef Ebeid, the Minister of Public Enterprise Sector and Minister of State for Administrative Development and Environment. His presentation is titled: "Privatization: the Egyptian Experience".

Dr. Ebeid's paper seeks to draw lessons from the Egyptian and other privatization experiences. These practical lessons should not be considered less important than theoretical principles since they (the lessons) provide decision-makers in countries that have not yet embarked upon the process of privatization with the main conceptual foundations and the structures which may support their efforts.

The paper also outlines the procedures which Egypt had so far adopted, and describes its notable achievements. According to Dr. Ebeid, privatization in Egypt started in 1990 and passed through several stages. These include:

(a) An extensive effort aimed at the development of awareness and change of culture of the senior level management in the public sector, in the academic community, and in the general public;
(b) The establishment of appropriate organizational arrangements to implement privatization;
(c) Providing the necessary legal backing;
(d) Classification of various enterprises into categories, e.g., those to be privatized, those to be restructured, and those to be liquidated, based on valuation; and
(e) Implementation of privatization programme.

According to Dr. Ebeid, the Egyptian effort had so far been successful although the process of privatization was a continuous one.

Participants' Comments

The participants raised a number of issues on the three presentations. Among these are the following:

(i) Will privatization succeed in the fragile economic environment of Africa?
(ii) Is the shift to market economy in the interest of the poor people of Africa?
(iii) What are the major problems of privatization? Instead of selling shares to individuals, why can't the government use holding companies in implementing privatization measures?
(iv) Is it not possible to have successful government-owned companies in Africa?
(v) How will privatization and commercialization take care of essential services such as electricity and water?
(vi) How do we ensure that the public assets being privatized or commercialized do not fall into the hands and control of the rich few, since the majority of the citizens do not have the resources to buy such assets?
(vii) What is the relationship between privatization and civil service reform? Can we also privatize the civil service?

(viii) Can we divorce privatization from politics?

(ix) Governments should adopt deliberate policies to ensure that the shares of privatized or commercialized enterprises are equitably distributed amongst the citizenry;

(x) Governments should not abdicate their social responsibilities to their citizens under the guise of privatization /commercialization;

(xi) Civil Service reforms are an integral aspect of public sector reforms and public officers should be educated to help to realize the objectives of the reforms;

(xii) Public enterprise reform must be inward driven and not imposed from outside;

(xiii) The content and speed of privatization reform should be left to each country to determine;

(xiv) Privatization/commercialization are political issues and good governance is a pre-requisite for their success.

ADVERTISEMENT IN AJPAM

The Editorial Board of AJPAM welcomes advertisements in the Journal. Prospective clients are advised to forward their advertisements at least two months before the intended date of publication. The rates are as follows:

	Per Annum	Per Insertion
Full page	$300.00	$150.00
Half page	$150.00	$80.00
Quarter page $80.00	$40.00	

SUBSCRIPTION RATES
(including postage)

	Per Annum	Per Copy
Corporate Members of AAPAM	$12.50	$7.50
Individual Members	$12.50	$7.50
Others	$20.00	$10.00

AJPAM SUBSCRIPTION FORM

1. I/We wish to subscribe to _____ copy/copies of the AFRICAN JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT with effect from the _____19_____ issue.

   My/Our mailing address is:

   Name_____

   Address_____

   _____

   _____

2. I/We attach My/Our Banker's Order/Standing Order from US Dollars cheques/convertible cheque for the sum of US$ _____ (See Subscription Rates).

3. I/We undertake to notify AJPAM of any change of address.

   Signature _____

Subscription forms should be returned to:

Dr. IJUKA KABUMBA
Secretary-General
AAPAM
P.O. Box 48677
Nairobi, Kenya
Tel.254-2-521844/521944